

Original Paper

A Descriptive Analysis of Job Satisfaction among Faculty Members: Case of Private Vocational and Technical Education Institutions, Baabda, Mount Lebanon, Lebanon

Hussein Nasser¹, Hussin J. Hejase^{2*}, Maryam Ali Mezher³, Mohammad Termos³ & Ale J. Hejase⁴

¹ Assistant Prof., Institute of Social Sciences & Faculty of Economics & Business Administration, Lebanese University, Beirut, Lebanon

² Consultant to the President, Professor of Business Administration, Al Maaref University, Beirut, Lebanon

³ Social Sciences Researcher, Saint Joseph University, Beirut, Lebanon

⁴ Adnan Kassar School of Business, Lebanese American University, Beirut, Lebanon

* Hussin J. Hejase, Consultant to the President, Professor of Business Administration, Al Maaref University, Beirut, Lebanon

Received: November 2, 2022 Accepted: November 16, 2022 Online Published: December 3, 2022

doi:10.22158/jbtp.v10n4p16

URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.22158/jbtp.v10n4p16>

Abstract

The study aimed to assess Job Satisfaction (JS) among teaching staff in private vocational and technical education institutions in Mount Lebanon, Lebanon. The study is descriptive and analytic, using a sample of 200 teachers from 13 schools and institutes chosen according to the coordinated random method. A questionnaire created and validated by Warr, Cook, and Wall is adopted to measure job satisfaction. This questionnaire includes personal information like job status, educational level, number of years of work, monthly income, age, gender, and social status. Using a seven-level Likert scale, it also contains 15 items to measure various dimensions of job satisfaction (internal and external factors). Results show a low overall mean of 4.69 out of 7 with a standard deviation of 1.15 for job satisfaction, based on data analysis using the SPSS program. Also, the majority of respondents are not satisfied with the wage received (the overall mean of job satisfaction=3.83, with a standard deviation of 2.00); there is a low level of JS among teachers concerning the degree of job security (mean=4.13 with a standard deviation of 1.91); there are no statistically significant differences in JS among teachers due to demographics. Capitalizing on the results, recommendations are made.

Keywords

Evaluation, Job Satisfaction, Vocational and Technical Education, Teaching Staff

1. Introduction

The topic of “job satisfaction” has become one of the topics of interest to behavioral scientists and management by examining the various aspects of employee satisfaction sources and measuring the degree of individuals’ satisfaction with their jobs, as well as examining the causes and sources of dissatisfaction (Antoncic, J. A. & Antoncic, B., 2011; Melián-González, Bulchand-Gidumal & López-Valcárcel, 2015). Different factors that affect employee satisfaction were monitored and assessed. Their loss leads to employee dissatisfaction affecting negatively their work performance (Warr, Cook & Wall, 1979; Warr, 1999; Al-Zoubi, 2011). Performance varies from one person to another and depends on the effort exerted conviction in the organization’s objectives, loyalty to it, and deep commitment to the required duties. Performance is related to how much an institution can satisfy individuals’ needs to continuously maximize their performance (Zoughaib, El Achi, El Dirani & Hejase, 2021), and such satisfaction is needed in the field of education (Kusku, 2003; Toker, 2011).

Loyalty is an important indicator of organizational success. In the education field, enthusiasm and dedication to work are the qualities of committed and dedicated faculty members (Todea, Davidescu, Pop & Stamule, 2022). Many teachers are proud of their belonging to their institution and profession, work hard, and actively strive to achieve the goals set. Others do not hesitate to absent themselves or be late and are satisfied with the minimum required performance if they do not leave the institution and seize any other job opportunity offered to them, a situation negatively affecting the institution’s performance (Yassin, 2003, p. 71).

Employee job satisfaction helps maintain a high level of performance. Researchers indicate that low levels of job satisfaction may lead to a decrease in faculty members’ productivity. Dissatisfaction is caused by apathy, loss of interest, and a low level of loyalty. Therefore, many contemporary researchers and educators have studied job satisfaction among teachers because of its impact and relationship with the quality of education and the level of student achievement (Al-Wahidi, 2000; Kusku, 2003; Toker, 2011).

Education undoubtedly plays a vital role in the lives of individuals and societies as it is the decisive factor on which the backwardness or progress of society depends. Teachers act as catalysts for the advancement or progress of society using science and knowledge. They are one of the main pillars in the educational process because they are owners of a sacred and honorable mission throughout the ages and generations. Hopenhayn (2006) posits that “Teachers’ role must include being open to students who, technologically speaking, are playing the roles of receptors and innovators... Based on such openness, they need to discover how to provide learning agendas and contexts” (p. 18).

Studies in education have paid attention to the faculty member and the factors that affect their performance as they represent the core of the educational process, and neither the state of education nor the education output is suitable unless the faculty member’s condition is correct (Alawneh, 2006; Hejase & Chehimi, 2021).

The vocational and technical education sector is an essential pillar of the national educational body, which is directly concerned with securing a segment of vocational and technical specialists for the labor market with expertise, skills, and high competencies at the national level (ILO, 2018). Many pieces of research (UNEVOC, 2005; Pavlova, 2014; Bagale, 2015) results assert that vocational and technical education has a key role in the growth and progress of nations and the enrichment of their civilization. The importance of the previous-mentioned role is highlighted as the basis of all learning, progress, and development of the human element (Fatima & Saleem, 2016) and leading to the construction and

advancement of society. Levinmichael and Pela (2021) contend that “Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) has the potential to improve employability, productivity, and livelihoods of young workers in developing countries” (para 2).

1.1 Vocational and Technical Education in Lebanon

Vocational and Technical Education (VTE) constitutes the cornerstone of secondary education that follows the stage of basic education and has been at the forefront of the pre-university education system in developed countries for decades, and the specializations of this education varied at all levels and fields (SENAI, 2015; MEHE, 2022; Scholaro, 2022).

According to the employment and labor market analysis Lebanon (ELMA Lebanon) (GIZ, 2019), “VTE and training system is the responsibility of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) and is managed by the Directorate General of Vocational and Technical Education” (DGVTE). According to the Director General of Vocational and Technical Education, Hanadi Berri (2022), “there are 170 specialties distributed at different levels of education, LT-TS-BT, i.e., secondary vocational education, technical supervisor of the Lebanese vocational, and technical education” (para 51). These are “taught by 159 public institutions” (para 61). Also, Karam (2006) posits that “vocational training focuses on the jobs and occupations which do not require extensive theoretical knowledge. It addresses practical and manual competencies and skills” (p. 262).

Worth to mention that a foreign missionary founded the first vocational school in Lebanon in 1863 (Nasser, 2019). While, the first official vocational school, “the School of Crafts and Arts” was founded in early 1905 and remained the only one even before the independence of Lebanon in 1943 (ibid). However, “after independence, VTE surged increasing to 435 institutions and schools (64 public and 371 private), comprising 86,000 students in various stages and specializations in 2002-2003” (Karam, 2006, p. 262). By 2021, there were 106,000 vocational and technical students, with 66,000 students distributed among the 159 public schools and institutions and 40,000 distributed in 259 private schools and institutes (Hanadi Berri, 2022, para 63).

It is agreed upon that vocational and technical education is of great importance. It aims to prepare and graduate working human cadres (Peters, n.d.; MacMillan Education, 2022).

1.2 Mount Lebanon's TVET

According to the Lebanese educational center for research and development (CRDP, 2021), the number of public vocational and technical schools and institutions for the academic year 2019-2020 reached 158 distributed (see Table 1). The total number of students attending public schools and institutions reached 60,698 (44.41% females and 55.59% males). Governorates of Mount Lebanon and Beirut, including Baabda District, have 24.60% of the schools and institutions, with 21.60% of the students. Moreover, Mount Lebanon includes 37.90% (256) private schools and institutions (Table 2), with 40.0% of the students (out of 35,181 students) whereby 58.67% are males and 41.33% females.

Table 1. Distribution of Public Vocational and Technical Schools and Institutions as well as Students in Lebanon (2019-2020)

Governorate	Schools, Percent, %	Students, Percent, %
Mount Lebanon	24.60 (includes Beirut)	21.60
North Lebanon	19.00	21.50
North Lebanon-Akar	14.60	16.60
South Lebanon	07.00	07.60
East Lebanon - Beqaa	12.00	10.70
East Lebanon-Baalbek & Hermel	11.40	11.80
Nabatieh - South	11.40	10.20
Beirut	-	-
	100.00	100.00

Source: CRDP, 2021, pp. 58-59.

Table 2. Distribution of Private Vocational and Technical Schools and Institutions as well as Students in Lebanon (2019-2020)

Governorate	Schools, Percent, %	Students, Percent, %
Mount Lebanon	37.90	40.00
North Lebanon	17.20	16.50
North Lebanon-Akar	06.60	05.00
South Lebanon	10.90	11.90
East Lebanon - Beqaa	05.90	03.90
East Lebanon-Baalbek & Hermel	05.10	07.40
Nabatieh - South	09.40	11.00
Beirut	07.00	04.30
	100.00	100.00

Source: CRDP, 2019, pp. 61-62

1.3 District of Baabda (This Study's Geographical Zone)

UNHCR (2021) reports that the “Governorates of Beirut and Mount Lebanon are considered the heart of Lebanon’s social, economic, political, and cultural activities. Administratively, Mount Lebanon constitutes six districts, namely Jbeil, Keserwan, Metn, Aley, Baabda, and Chouf” (para 1). Figure 1 illustrates a representative map of the governorates. Also, the web page City facts (2020) offers the following information: The area of the District of Baabda is 194.9 km²; its population reaches about 1.2 million, with 51% males (588,584 individuals) and 49% females (565, 155 individuals). Their overall median age is 28.2 years old (the male median age is 29.6 years, and the female median age is 26.8 years).



Figure 1. The Governorate of Mount Lebanon Shows the District of Baabda

Source: World Atlas, 2022; UNHCR, 2021.

According to a study by UNICEF (2020), introducing an educational map of the public technical institutes and schools for the academic year 2019-2020, the number of students enrolled in 157 institutes was 60,151 in all academic specialties, with 55.3% males and 44.7% females. Also, 19.5% (11,748 students) are in Mount Lebanon Governorate whereby more specifically, the Baabda district has 9.9% (5,959 persons) of the student population, with 43.3% (2,582 persons) females and 56.7% (3,377 persons) males. The private sector in Mount Lebanon has around 252 private schools, with about 30,000 students in all academic specialties, with 56% males and 44% females. In addition, the Baabda district has about 11% of the student population or 3,300 students. In total, there are about 5,900 students in public and private vocational and technical schools. Furthermore, the Kompas website (2022) shows that there are about 68 education and training institutions, including professional training ones. For more accuracy, information from the website Edu-Leb.net (2021) reports the names of 13 public vocational and technical institutions constituting about 30% of Mount Lebanon’s total number of schools (about 39 public institutions), knowing that there are around 97 private institutions in Mount Lebanon, and considering an approximate ratio, then it results in 32 private institutions in Baabda making the total 45 public and private vocational and technical schools (this is a more realistic number for the district in the absence of concrete data). Furthermore, Sarah (2021) reports that the total teaching staff of the “Directorate of Vocational and Technical Education is about 1,200 instructors

(16.67%) who are full-time in that body, and also about 6,000 instructors (83.33%) who are contracted only with the sector” (para 8). That is 7200 teaching staff for a total of about 400 vocational and technical schools or a ratio of 1 instructor to 18 students. Based on such information, the Baabda district requires 328 instructors divided into 55 full-time faculty versus 273 part-time faculty.

1.4 Study Significance

The importance of this study can be summarized as follows:

- * Uncovering the extent of job satisfaction among teachers in VTE and its reflection on the educational process.
- * The study will close the gap in the Lebanese research work related to job satisfaction among teaching staff in private VTE in the Baabda district part of Mount Lebanon in Lebanon. Since this sector includes double the number of institutions and about 35% of the students enrolled in VTE in Lebanon.
- * The outcomes shall benefit policymakers in the MEHE, the Directorate of Vocational and Technical Education, vocational and technical schools’ principles and instructors, experts in the subject, and interested NGOs.

1.5 Objectives of the Study

The main objective is to identify what affects the job satisfaction of male and female teachers in private VTE institutions in the Baabda district, Mount Lebanon, Lebanon.

The study also will address several sub-objectives:

- Identifying the level of job satisfaction among selected teachers in VTE institutions
- Identifying the relationship between the organizational environment and the level of job satisfaction among teachers in VTE institutions
- Determine the relationship between the teacher’s job satisfaction and demographic variables (gender, age, educational level, social status, years of experience, and average income...).

1.6 Problem Definition

There is scant research in Lebanon characterizing Job satisfaction in institutions of vocational and technical education (VTE) (Nasser, 2019). More is reported about policies, the current status, and challenges for the VTE institutions (Kanso, 1999, 2006; Karam, 2006; Ghneim, 2018; ILO, 2018; GIZ, 2019; UNICEF, 2020; CRDP, 2021; UNHCR, 2021). The above shows that a gap exists in the study of organizational behavior in the literature on TVET in Lebanon. Studies show that satisfying the needs of individuals in the organization leads to achieving a high level of job satisfaction for them which, in turn, affects productivity, absenteeism, and the individual’s overall behavior toward their work and the organization (Al-Wahidi, 2000; Kusku, 2003; Yassin, 2003; Toker, 2011). The organizational commitment subject is one of the topics that secondary data have dealt with from multiple aspects and in different ways. Also, these studies have shown that the economic growth achieved by developed countries is due to a committed workforce. Hence, belongingness and loyalty to the organization, keenness to make efforts for its continuity, and realizing its desired goals are highly sought by organizations because, in turn, these factors lead to achieving quality and raising productivity rates (Symonds, 2022).

The study problem leads to the following main questions applied to the district of Baabda:

- 1) How can the teachers’ level of job satisfaction in private institutes be raised, and
- 2) What effects does teachers’ job satisfaction cause on the quality of educational services in these institutes?

1.7 Study Sub-Questions (SQs)

- SQ1. What is the extent of job satisfaction among teachers in private VTE institutions?
- SQ2. What is the extent of satisfaction of faculty members in private VTE institutions concerning financial offerings?
- SQ3. What is the extent of satisfaction of faculty members in private VTE institutions concerning job stability?
- SQ4. What type of relationship exists between job satisfaction and the organizational environment of teachers in private VTE institutions in Lebanon in the Baabda District?
- SQ5. Is there a statistically significant relationship between teachers' job satisfaction and demographic variables (like gender, age, educational level, social status, years of experience, income rate, and social benefits)?

1.8 Research Hypothesis

Null Hypothesis 1-H₀₅: There are no statistically significant differences in job satisfaction among faculty members due to gender, educational level, social status, years of experience, and average income.

1.9 Terminology of the Study

1.9.1 Job Satisfaction (JS)

There are three different factors of job satisfaction (Ginzberg, Ginsburg, Axelrad & Herma, 1951). Al-Dubai, Gopalan, Alaghbari & Hamood (2019) contend that these factors include "internal satisfaction and its source of job happiness, the individual's sense and feeling about the social levels of success achieves, and the individual's abilities in the success achieved. In addition, external satisfaction factors like rewards, wages, relationships, and how much these are to the individual's expectations as a function of values and objectives?" (p. 3).

Locke (1976) defined it as "... a pleasurable or positive emotional state resulting from the appraisal of one's job or job experiences" (p. 1304). Saari and Judge (2004) contend that "Implicit in Locke's definition is the importance of both effects or feeling, and cognition, or thinking" (p. 396). Cranny, Smith, and Stone (1992), cited in Booyesen (2008), "contend that overall JS describes a person's affective reaction to work-related factors. They also cited key examples of JS facets such as "satisfaction with pay, promotion, immediate manager, and co-workers" (p. 3). Also, Friday and Friday (2003) contend that "JS is a complex job-related variable related to employees' attitudes". Weiss (2002) defines job satisfaction as "a positive (or negative) evaluative judgment one makes about one's job or situation" (p. 175). And Green and Heywood (2008) define JS "as a person's feeling toward the job which incites motivation... It reflects the simple feeling-state accompanying the attainment of goals or objectives" (pp. 710-728).

Based on the previously-mentioned review, there are multiple definitions of JS whereby some defined it as the fulfillment of the individual's expected needs from the job, others as the emotional response of the worker toward work and defined it as the worker's attitude towards work. In conclusion, JS is an individual's emotional reaction (response) to the extent that his/her physical and social status are satisfied with belongingness to the organization according to expectations and the nature of his/her personality.

1.9.2 Vocational and Technical Education (VTE)

Vocational education cannot be separated at all from the educational system in its large form. According to Al-Khatib (1995), “Vocational education in its broadest form is that type of education that makes an individual capable of working in a group of professions a fact that is better than general education in its ability to work in another group. It is equally important even though it does not consider individuals qualified to work” (p. 51).

The Training Industry website (2022) defines vocational training as “education and skills-based training programs that prepare people for a specific job, trade, or craft that are manual in nature and are considered non-academic. Vocational training focuses on procedural knowledge as opposed to theoretical or declarative knowledge” (Training Industry, 2022, para 1).

Vocational and Technical education are formal education that provide educational preparation and behavioral guidance. The first prepares students with professional skills and abilities from formal institutions at the secondary school level covering various professional fields and specializations. Vocational Education (VE) “enables students to carry out their tasks by contributing to individual and collective production. Such students link between technical skilled (graduates of technical education institutes) and unskilled workers. Preparation for VE takes 2 to 3 years, after the basic education stage, and age groups of 15 years or more” (Fallata, 1994, p. 23).

Technical Education (TE): In addition to acquiring manual skills and technical ability from formal educational institutions for a period of no less than two years after high school and below the level of university, students get prepared as a specialized workforce responsible for employment. TE is “a link between planners and specialists from university graduates on the one hand and skilled workers on the other hand, and it can direct production plans and work to implement them with the skilled workforce” (ibid, p. 24).

2. Review of Relevant Empirical Studies

Numerous studies on the subject of Job Satisfaction (JS) exist, and this topic has been and still is of great importance, especially because of its impact on increasing productivity and raising the level of performance. These studies include:

Fuwawi’s (2007) aimed to identify JS and its relationship to Organizational Commitment (OC) among educational supervisors in the Department of Education in the City of Makkah Al-Mukarramah. Findings showed that education supervisors enjoy a high level of JS and OC. Findings also show a moderate positive correlation ($R=0.571$) between JS with its dimensions and OC. In addition, there exist statistically significant differences in the degrees of JS according to specialization in favor of scientific disciplines as well as according to sex in favor of males. Moreover, there were statistically significant differences in the degrees of OC according to specialization in favor of scientific disciplines, and according to sex favoring males, and scientific qualification in favor of Ph.D. holders.

Al-Ghaniem (2007) assessed the relationship between Organizational Loyalty (OL) and JS among the staff at An Najah National University. It investigated as well the effect of demographic variables on the relationship between OL and JS. A three-part questionnaire was administered to a sample of 144 staff. The first part included demographic questions, the second consisted of statements to measure OL and the third measured JS. The results showed that OL and JS are high among employees; there are some statistically significant differences in the level of OL attributed to sex and academic rank; there is no

statistically significant difference in JS attributed to sex; and there are no statistically significant differences between the level of OL and JS attributed to the experience, age, and income.

Usop, Askandar, Langguyuan-Kadtong & Usop (2013) attempted to define the relationship between work performance and JS among teachers of the Division of Cotabato City in the Philippines. The study used the descriptive correlation design. 200 full-time elementary teachers from 12 selected public schools in the selected area responded to a formal questionnaire. Results showed that most teachers are in the 31-40 years of age bracket, most are females, married, and earned a college degree. 64% percent had 11 to 15 years of service. Moreover, researchers concluded that the teachers displayed a high level of performance. "Teachers were pleased with their JS facets such as school policies, supervision, pay, interpersonal relations, opportunities for promotion and growth, working conditions, work itself, achievement, recognition, and responsibility" (ibid). Furthermore, the teachers' satisfaction with their jobs insinuated they were also productive and maintained a high level of performance.

Namaziandost, Inayat & Jahanzeb Khan (2021) studied the effect of JS on the performance of employees working in private sector organizations in Peshawar, Pakistan. They used a quantitative approach based on formal surveys including a Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire (MSQ-short form) developed by Weiss et al. and a self-constructed Performance Evaluation Form (PRF). 180 employees were selected using random sampling from private organizations, i.e., hospitals, banks, and universities in Peshawar. The findings of the study show that on one side the type of occupation and JS have shown a significant correlation and on another side JS with the performance of employees. The study concluded that satisfied employees have better performance than dissatisfied ones, thus having a significant role in betterment of their organizations.

Al-Reeh (2018) identified the level of JS and professional performance of Basic-level teachers in Aljawda Private Schools. The research was descriptive and used a questionnaire distributed to 30 Basic-level teachers. Results were generated using the SPSS software. Findings included: there is a higher level of JS for teachers in the selected schools; teachers have a higher level of professional performance; there is a positive correlation between the level of JS and professional performance among teachers. Moreover, there are no differences with statistical significance between the JS scale and level of professional performance according to sex, academic qualification, and years of experience, while there was a significant difference between the JS scale and level of professional performance according to training.

Bakotić (2016) explored the link between JS and Organizational Performance (OP), as well as assessed the empirical relationship, the direction, and the intensity between these two variables. The study constituted 40 large- and medium-sized Croatian companies, with 5806 employees surveyed. Results showed there is a link between employees' JS and OP in both directions, but with weak intensity. Furthermore, the connection between JS and OP is stronger than that between OP and JS.

Budhathoki's (2021) main objective was to explore teachers' satisfaction and the implications on their job performance. The study used a qualitative phenomenological research design focusing on teachers' job satisfaction perspectives. Secondary data were analyzed qualitatively with critical review. Results showed that "a lack of resources, dynamic leadership, learners' discipline, recognition for good work done, job security, professional opportunities, in addition to work overload, low salary, administrative issues, overcrowded classes were serious sources of dissatisfaction among teachers" (Budhathoki, 2021, p. 79).

Commenting on the previous studies, among many others, it is clear that they varied according to the various goals sought to be achieved, the different topics researched, and the variety of environments in which they took place. Studies indicated that the level of loyalty and JS is high, and others indicated it is moderate. There is also a discrepancy in the results of previous studies regarding sex. Some studies have concluded there are no sex differences in loyalty and JS, while others have indicated gender differences existed in JS in favor of males. More differences in the results of previous studies existed concerning variables such as specialization, academic rank, and the relationship of these variables to loyalty and organizational satisfaction.

3. Research Methodology

This study is quantitative using a purposive and convenient sample. Participants sought were teachers who show a willingness to participate. The selected teachers belonged to 13 high schools covering 30 TVET professions in the Baabda district of Mount Lebanon, Lebanon. Each profession constitutes about 15% of the sample, so the final total size of the sample was 200 teachers. The purpose of this tool is to collect all the data to assess the reality of job satisfaction among instructors in the selected institutions. Two hundred fifty questionnaires were distributed, with 200 valid questionnaires returned (the response rate was 80%). This rate is the result of some schools' strict policies against the staff's participation in filling out external surveys related to the school's teaching policies. However, to ascertain the reliability of the sample size, the researchers followed Hashem et al.'s (2022) and Younis et al.'s (2022) approach by reviewing Hardwick Research's (2022) resources. Therefore, having a population size of about 500 with a standard error of [$\alpha=5\%$] and seeking acceptable reliability within 5%, a sample size of 200 would be selected. Based on Table 1, statistical reliability of about $\pm 5.4\%$ is achieved, i.e., from every 94.6 repetitions of the survey out of 100, an error of $\pm 5.4\%$ results. The resultant reliability is acceptable in exploratory research.

Statistical Reliability at the 95% Confidence Level
(50/50% proportion characteristic)

Sample Size	Population						
	100	500	1,000	5,000	10,000	100,000	1 Mill+
30	$\pm 14.7\%$	$\pm 17.1\%$	$\pm 17.3\%$	$\pm 17.6\%$	$\pm 17.7\%$	$\pm 17.8\%$	$\pm 17.9\%$
50	$\pm 9.7\%$	$\pm 13.1\%$	$\pm 13.5\%$	$\pm 13.8\%$	$\pm 13.9\%$	$\pm 14.0\%$	$\pm 14.1\%$
75	$\pm 5.6\%$	$\pm 10.4\%$	$\pm 10.9\%$	$\pm 11.3\%$	$\pm 11.4\%$	$\pm 11.5\%$	$\pm 11.6\%$
100		$\pm 8.8\%$	$\pm 9.3\%$	$\pm 9.7\%$	$\pm 9.8\%$	$\pm 9.9\%$	$\pm 10.0\%$
200		$\pm 5.4\%$	$\pm 6.2\%$	$\pm 6.8\%$	$\pm 6.9\%$	$\pm 7.0\%$	$\pm 7.1\%$
300		$\pm 3.6\%$	$\pm 4.7\%$	$\pm 5.5\%$	$\pm 5.6\%$	$\pm 5.7\%$	$\pm 5.8\%$
400		$\pm 2.2\%$	$\pm 3.8\%$	$\pm 4.7\%$	$\pm 4.8\%$	$\pm 4.9\%$	$\pm 5.0\%$
525			$\pm 3.0\%$	$\pm 4.1\%$	$\pm 4.2\%$	$\pm 4.3\%$	$\pm 4.4\%$
725			$\pm 1.9\%$	$\pm 3.4\%$	$\pm 3.5\%$	$\pm 3.6\%$	$\pm 3.7\%$
800			$\pm 1.6\%$	$\pm 3.2\%$	$\pm 3.4\%$	$\pm 3.5\%$	$\pm 3.6\%$

Figure 2. Statistical Reliability versus Sample Size

Source: Hardwick Research, 2022.

In preparing this study and verifying the hypotheses, the researchers will rely on two basic approaches:

- 1) An analytical and descriptive approach related to the literature review to determine the scientific standards on which the concepts of the organizational environment and job satisfaction were based.
- 2) The field analytical approach is based on a representative sample for the study and running a survey to collect primary data.

This methodology is based on a questionnaire tool.

The questionnaire will be distributed to teachers in 13 out of 30 professions, especially in the Baabda district. Each profession constitutes about 15% of the sample so the final total of the sample is 200 faculty members.

The purpose of this tool is to collect all the data to assess the reality of job satisfaction among instructors in the selected institutions.

3.1 Research Scope

Objective: Assessment of job satisfaction among academic staff in the private VTE institutions in the Baabda's District Institutions.

Location: Private vocational and technical education institutions located in Baabda District.

Time limits: The 2013-2014 academic year (before the serious socio-political events resulting in freezing many of the schooling activities. As well as before the Pandemic years).

Human Borders: Teachers in private VTE institutions in the Baabda District Institutions in Lebanon.

3.2 The Study Population and Its Sample

3.2.1 Study Community

The study population consists of all faculty members in private VTE institutions in the Baabda District in Lebanon. Private institutes are of two types, individual private institutes and other social institutes affiliated with civil or religious institutions.

Worth mentioning that the researchers considered private education institutions that follow formal education, i.e., teaching according to the stages of education that lead to official certificates. Thus, excluding the private vocational training centers, which rely upon their programs to conduct special training courses that do not lead to official certifications because these institutions are training centers, and their specifications are far from those related to the technical school or institute.

The number of private schools has reached 45 schools and institutes and includes 328 male and female teachers (discussed earlier in this paper).

3.2.2 The Study Sample

The study sample selected the non-probabilistic convenient sampling based on the teacher's free will to participate. Respondents were promised confidentiality in that no personal identification is involved and those research outcomes will be used solely for academic research.

3.3 Questionnaire Design

The questionnaire starts with an opening statement followed by another dealing with confidentiality. The questionnaire consists of 23 questions divided into two sections:

- 1) Section one: Assesses the respondents' intrinsic or internal job satisfaction factors based on fifteen statements depicted in Table 2 (note: This study relied on the questionnaire proposed by Peter Warr and colleagues John Cook, & Toby Wall in 1979 to measure job satisfaction).

Questions one through fifteen assess how the respondents feel about the internal and external job satisfaction elements. The original questionnaire used codes varying from 5.1 to 5.15 as shown in Table 2.

- 2) Section two: Assesses the respondents' demographic variables (i.e., sex, marital status, job status, experience, education, and salary). Finally, one close-ended question is added to encourage respondents to express themselves regarding how they feel about the job as a whole.

Table 3. Internal and External Job Satisfaction Elements

No.	Statement	Code in Source	Classification
1	The physical work conditions	5.1	External
2	The freedom to choose the method of working	5.2	Internal
3	One's fellow workers	5,3	External
4	The recognition received for good work	5.4	Internal
5	One's immediate boss	5.5	External
6	The amount of responsibility given to one	5.6	Internal
7	One's rate of pay	5.7	External
8	One's opportunity to use abilities	5.8	Internal
9	Industrial relations between management and workers in one's firm	5.9	External
10	One's chance of promotion	5.10	Internal
11	The way one's firm is managed	5.11	External
12	The attention paid to suggestions one makes	5.12	Internal
13	One's hours of work	5.13	External
14	The amount of variety in one's job	5.14	Internal
15	One's job security	5.15	External
16	Now, considering everything, how do you feel about your job as a whole?		

Source: Warr, Cook & Wall, 1979, pp. 145-146.

Questions used dyadic, multiple choice, and 7-level Likert scale styles. The Likert scale used seven levels following the original work of Warr et al. (1979) as follows: "1) I am very dissatisfied; 2) I am moderately dissatisfied; 3) I am somewhat dissatisfied; 4) I am not sure; 5) I am somewhat satisfied; 6) I am moderately satisfied, and 7) I am very satisfied".

3.4 Importance of the Questionnaire

This study relied on the questionnaire proposed by Peter Warr and colleagues John Cook & Toby Wall in 1979 to measure job satisfaction. Also, in 1999, Sheffield University in Britain issued a job satisfaction measure with a user guide that contains analytical statistics of job satisfaction rates for a wide range of industries and different jobs. This guide has information about job satisfaction rates for diverse sectors of business and professions and has collected more than 40,000 users of this metric. A second edition of the guide was released in 2007 due to its wide use. It contained descriptive rates and ratios (Benchmarks) collected from more than 57,000 users of this scale (Al-Zoubi, 2011, p. 27).

3.5 Data Analysis

IBM's "Statistical Product and Service Solutions" (Hejase & Hejase, 2013), SPSS version 23.0 program, was used to treat all responses. Descriptive statistics are used including data tables, with frequency and percentage distributions. Moreover, Cross-tabulations and Regression analyses were run to study the variables' relationships.

4. Results and Discussion

Respondents are 58.5% females and 41.5% males, 42% of them are single, and 58% are married. Also, 46% are under 30 years of age, 42.5% are in the range 30 to 40 years, and 11.5% are more than 40 years old. More results show that 47.5% of respondents work full-time and 52.5% are part-time employees. As for the respondents education, 32% hold a Master's degree in Business Administration, 45% hold a Bachelor's degree, 11% earned a teaching diploma, 8.5% hold a vocational certificate, and 3.5% are Ph.D. holders. Moreover, 50% of respondents have less than five (5) years of experience, 25% have between 5 to 10 years of experience, and another 25% have more than 10 years of experience. Finally, 48% earn less than 500 USD monthly, 37.5% earn between 500 and 1000 USD per month, and the remaining 14.5% earn more than 1000 USD monthly.

After collecting the results from the sample, the data were statistically analyzed via the SPSS program, and the results were as follows:

4.1 General Results of Field Research

4.1.1 Analysis per Item

This analysis groups the 7-level Likert scale as follows: Dissatisfaction includes items 1 to 3 "very dissatisfied; moderately dissatisfied; somewhat dissatisfied", respectively; neutral includes item 4: I am not sure; and Satisfaction includes items 5 to 7 "somewhat satisfied; moderately satisfied, and very satisfied", respectively. Therefore, three levels are reported besides the mean and standard deviation per statement. Table 3 depicts the results.

Table 4. Internal and External Job Satisfaction Elements

No.	Statement	Satisfaction	Neutral	Dissatisfaction	Mean	Standard Deviation	Type
1	The physical work conditions	58.85%	3.13%	38.02%	4.34	1.94	External
2	The freedom to choose your method of working	76.14%	4.57%	19.29%	5.15	1.53	Internal
3	Your fellow workers	90.72%	0.52%	8.76%	5.86	1.40	External
4	The recognition you get for good work	70.68%	6.81%	22.51%	4.87	1.83	Internal
5	Your immediate boss	78.01%	9.42%	12.57%	5.38	1.54	External
6	The amount of responsibility you are given	67.50%	8.00%	24.50%	4.90	1.68	Internal
7	Your rate of pay	45.69%	4.50%	49.75%	3.83	2.00	External
8	Opportunity to use your abilities	61.22%	5.10%	33.67%	4.53	1.82	Internal
9	Industrial relations between management and workers in your firm	69.15%	10.11%	20.74%	5.04	1.76	External
10	Your chance of promotion	46.24%	23.12%	30.65%	4.23	1.75	Internal
11	The way your firm is managed	62.37%	10.22%	27.42%	4.62	1.77	External
12	The attention paid to suggestions you make	56.02%	14.66%	29.32%	4.52	1.76	Internal
13	Your hours of work	60.31%	8.76%	30.93%	4.60	1.93	External
14	The amount of variety in your job	57.51%	13.47%	29.02%	4.51	1.65	Internal
15	Your job security	47.72%	20.81%	31.47%	4.13	1.91	External

Results shown in Table 4 show there are six (6) items only out of fifteen which respondents were somewhat satisfied. Three items represented external factors and three internal factors. The relationships with colleagues scored the highest (item 3/external). 90.72% of the respondents are satisfied with the level of their relationship with colleagues at work (mean=5.86 and standard deviation of 1.40). The second place went to item 5 (external), 78.01% of the respondents were satisfied with the performance of their immediate superior (mean=5.38 with a standard deviation of 1.54). While the third place was item 2 (internal), 76.14% of the respondents were satisfied with the level of freedom in choosing the way to complete the work (mean=5.15 with a standard deviation of 1.53). The fourth place was item 9 (external), 69.15% of the respondents were satisfied with the professional relationship between management and employees (mean=5.04 with a standard deviation of 1.76). Following the top four items, two internal items were marginally somewhat satisfied. In item 6 (internal), 67.50% of the respondents were satisfied with the limitation of liability given to them (mean=4.90 with a standard deviation of 1.68), and in Item 4 (internal), 70.68% of the respondents were satisfied with the level of appreciation they get after completing the work well (mean=4.87 with a standard deviation of 1.83).

Items with high-end neutral (not sure) included five items (three are internal and two external). The highest scores were for two external factors, items 11 and 13. In item 11, 62.37% of the respondents were satisfied with the way the institution is run (mean=4.62 with a standard deviation of 1.77), and in item 13, 60.31% of the respondents were satisfied with their working hours (mean=4.60 with a standard deviation of 1.93). Followed by three internal items, namely item 8, 61.22% of the respondents being satisfied with the opportunity to use their abilities at work (mean=4.53 with a standard deviation of 1.82); item 12, 56.02% of the respondents are satisfied with the level of interest in their suggestions (mean=4.52 with a standard deviation of 1.76) and item 14, 57.51% of the sample are satisfied with the degree of diversity in the tasks they perform (mean=4.51 with a standard deviation of 1.65).

Four items were marginally neutral (with three external and one internal). Item 1 (external), 58.85% of the respondents being satisfied with the level of physical working conditions (workplace, work tools, etc.) (mean=4.34 with a standard deviation of 1.94) and item 10 (internal), 46.24% of the respondents were satisfied with the opportunity to be promoted in the job (mean=4.23 with a standard deviation of 1.75). Then, in item 15 (external), 47.72% of the respondents were satisfied with the degree of job security (guaranteeing work continuity) (mean=4.13 with a standard deviation of 1.91) and in item 7 (external), 45.69% of the respondents being satisfied with the percentage of wages paid to them (mean=3.83 standard deviation of 2.00).

Table 5. Summary of Respondents' Classification of Job Satisfaction (JS) Factors

No.	Statement	Type	Somewhat Satisfied	high-end neutral	marginally neutral
1	The physical work conditions	External			x
2	The freedom to choose your method of working	Internal	x		
3	Your fellow workers	External	x		
4	The recognition you get for good work	Internal	x		
5	Your immediate boss	External	x		
6	The amount of responsibility you are given	Internal	x		
7	Your rate of pay	External			x
8	Your opportunity to use your abilities	Internal		x	
9	Industrial relations between management and workers in one's firm	External	x		
10	One's chance of promotion	Internal			x
11	The way one's firm is managed	External		x	
12	The attention paid to suggestions you make	Internal		x	
13	Your hours of work	External		x	
14	The amount of variety in your job	Internal		x	
15	Your job security	External			x

4.1.2 Analysis per Grouping of Factors

Table 5 depicts the following results,

Job satisfaction rate in the surveyed institutions as a whole: 4.63 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 1.77

The rate of job satisfaction with the physical (external) dimensions at work (satisfaction with the work environment, the relationship with colleagues, the performance of the direct manager, ...) is 4.71 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 1.79.

The rate of job satisfaction with the moral (internal) dimensions at work (feeling of importance and appreciation, opportunities for development, sense of responsibility, ...) is 4.57 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 1.72.

Table 6. Results by Grouping Factors

No.	Statement	Mean	Std. Dev.
Somewhat Satisfied			
2	The freedom to choose your method of working [Int]	5.15	1.53
4	The recognition you get for good work [Int]	4.87	1.83
6	The amount of responsibility you are given [Int]	4.90	1.68
Internal Factors		4.97	1.68
3	Your fellow workers [Ext]	5.86	1.40
5	Your immediate boss [Ext]	5.38	1.54
9	Industrial relation between management and workers in your firm [Ext]	5.04	1.76
External Factors		5.43	1.57
Overall [6 items]		5.200	1.623
High-End Neutral			
8	Your opportunity to use your abilities [Int]	4.53	1.82
12	The attention paid to suggestions you make [Int]	4.52	1.76
14	The amount of variety in your job [Int]	4.51	1.65
Internal Factors		4.52	1.74
11	The way your firm is managed [Ext]	4.62	1.77
13	Your hours of work [Ext]	4.60	1.93
External Factors		4.61	1.85
Overall [5 items]		4.556	1.786
Marginally Neutral			
10	Your chance of promotion [Int]	4.23	1.75
1	The physical work conditions [Ext]	4.34	1.94
7	Your rate of pay [Ext]	3.83	2.00
15	Your job security [Ext]	4.13	1.91
External		4.10	1.95
Overall [4 items]		4.133	1.900
Overall [15 items]		4.63	1.77
Internal Factors		4.57	1.72
External Factors		4.71	1.79

4.1.3 Rates of Job Satisfaction According to Demographic Variables

Next are some tables that show job satisfaction rates broken down by job status, educational level, years of work, average monthly income, age, gender, and social status:

A. Job satisfaction by job status

Results show that the relationship between job status (full-time and contracted), and three dimensions general, external, and internal job satisfaction, is as follows: General job satisfaction versus full-time status (mean=4.66, s.dev.=1.26), part-time status (mean=4.73, s.dev.=1.05); internal job satisfaction versus full-time status (mean=4.71, s.dev.=1.28), part-time status (mean=4.65, s.dev.=1.07); and external job satisfaction versus full-time (mean=4.61, s.dev.=1.32) and part-time status (mean=4.79, s.dev.=1.16). Therefore, there were small differences in the satisfaction of both the full-time and the part-time instructors. The level of JS falls as before at the high end of the neutral scale. Therefore, both full-timers and part-timers are not impressed by either the external factors or the internal factors.

B. Job satisfaction by education level

Table 7. JS versus the Participants' Education Level

Educ.	Freq.	General Job Satisf.		External Job Satisf.		Internal Job Satisf.	
		Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.
Ph.D.	7	5.04	0.55	5.08	0.53	4.98	0.67
MS/MA	64	4.72	0.99	4.76	1.07	4.68	1.03
Certif.	22	4.36	1.26	4.33	1.40	4.40	1.18
BS/BA	90	4.77	1.28	4.76	1.34	4.78	1.30
Tech.Spec.	17	4.49	1.06	4.55	1.19	4.42	1.05

Table 7 shows the largest number of the sample are university degree holders, while we find that the number of teachers who hold doctorate degrees is very few. In addition, while the doctorate holders recorded the highest mean of satisfaction in general, external, and internal, bachelor's degree holders come second and holders of a Master's degree come in third place. The holders of vocational and technical specialization come in fourth.

C. Job satisfaction by years of work and by monthly salary

Table 8. JS versus the Participants' Work Experience & Monthly Salary

Years of Exp.	Freq.	General Job Satisf.		External Job Satisf.		Internal Job Satisf.	
		Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.
<5 years	100	4.76	0.99	4.79	1.07	4.71	1.03
5-10 years	50	4.74	1.20	4.83	1.31	4.62	1.19
>10 years	50	4.52	1.39	4.39	1.43	4.68	1.41
Monthly Salary, USD							
		Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.
<500	96	4.55	0.94	4.60	1.07	4.49	0.94
Between 500 & 1000	75	4.77	1.32	4.73	1.35	4.82	1.37
>1000	29	4.95	1.32	4.97	1.43	4.94	1.25

Table 8 shows the relationship between years of work experience versus JS. Results show that one finds no significant differences in the means for new employees and those who have a great experience. The table also shows that when considering each category individually, teachers who have less than 5 years of experience show about the same JS in general as well as when considering external and internal factors. Those with a moderate number of years of experience (between 5 and 10 years) are affected more by external factors in comparison with internal or general factors. Finally, those teachers with more than 10 years of experience show that their JS is more internally motivated when compared with external or general factors.

Table 7 also shows that the participants whose salary is less than 500USD show higher job satisfaction with external factors in comparison to internal and general factors. Participants who have a salary between 500 and 1000 USD show higher job satisfaction with internal factors as compared with the other two, and participants who earn more than 1000 USD show very small differences due to internal, external, and general factors however, higher job satisfaction when compared with less salaried teachers.

D. Job satisfaction by age, sex, and marital status

Table 9. JS versus the Participants' Age Category, by Sex, and by Marital Status

Age, years	Freq.	General Job Satisf.		External Job Satisf.		Internal Job Satisf.	
		Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.
<30	92	4.60	0.97	4.65	1.07	4.54	1.00
Between 30 & 40	85	4.70	1.25	4.69	1.35	4.72	1.21
>40	23	5.03	1.44	4.98	1.42	5.09	1.53
Sex		Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.	Mean	S.Dev.
Male	83	4.57	1.15	4.58	1.28	4.54	1.10
Female	117	4.78	1.16	4.79	1.20	4.78	1.21
Marital Status							
Single	84	4.60	1.05	4.57	1.15	4.63	1.03
Married	116	4.76	1.22	4.80	1.29	4.71	1.27

Results in Table 9 show a direct and increasing relationship between the means of JS and age, i.e., job satisfaction increases with increasing age. In addition, teachers/instructors who are older than 40 years show the highest mean of JS along the three dimensions of satisfaction that is, the highest due to internal motivators followed by external motivators. Moreover, younger teachers are affected by external factors in their JS, while teachers older than 30 years are influenced by internal factors in their JS.

More results from Table 8 show that males and females, on average, do not show differences in the impact of external and internal factors on their JS. However, females' job satisfaction is more salient and higher in comparison to males on all three dimensions.

Moreover, married participants show higher JS along the three dimensions in comparison to single participants. Another observation is that single teachers are motivated more by internal factors while married teachers are motivated by external factors.

4.2 Analysis of Research Questions

SQ1. What is the extent of job satisfaction among teachers in private VTE institutions?

The overall JS mean that includes both the overall external items and the overall internal items falls in the category of high-end neutral (not sure), i.e., 4.63 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 1.77 (rather high). Such results did not match the findings of Usop et al. (2013) who noted high job satisfaction with a mixture of both internal and external factors. This research's result reflects diverse opinions among the participants leading to a broad range of agreement about external and internal factors considered sources of motivation to raise job satisfaction. For example, the agreement that external factors act as motivators varies from a minimum of 45.69% (related to salary or pay) to a maximum of 90.72% (related to relationship with peers). Moreover, the agreement that internal factors act as motivators varies from a minimum of 46.24% (related to promotion) to a maximum of 76.14% (related to the choice of work methods). Such diversity shows the different teachers' feelings about their jobs, although doing a similar job within the same work environment. Cranny, Smith, and Stone (1992), cited in Booysen (2008), posit

that different persons describe their satisfaction differently stating “the overall job satisfaction describes a person’s affective reaction to work-related factors. Also, they identified some key examples of job satisfaction facets found in the literature, such as satisfaction with pay, promotion, supervisor, and co-workers” (Cranny et al., 1992 cited in Booyesen, 2008, p. 3). On the other hand, Friday and Friday (2003) contended that “JS is a complex job-related variable that has a relationship with the employees’ attitudes”.

Therefore, this research concludes that the level of JS among teachers of the selected sample is low according to the teachers’ capabilities and specifications.

SQ2. What is the extent of JS of faculty members in private VTE institutions concerning financial offerings?

Results depicted in Table 3 show that a low 45.69% of the respondents are satisfied with the percentage of wages paid to them, 49.75% are dissatisfied, and 4.57% are unsure. In addition, the overall mean for JS concerning paid wages was 3.83 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 2.00. Such a level of job satisfaction is the lowest among all external factors. In light of the previous data, it is clear that the majority of the surveyed teachers are not satisfied with the wages received. Such a conclusion of low-level teachers’ JS in private VTE education institutions in Baabda concerning financial offerings is adequately assessed and proven.

SQ3. What is the extent of job satisfaction of faculty members in private vocational and technical education institutions concerning job stability?

Table 3 shows that 47.72% of the sample are satisfied with the degree of job security (guaranteeing work continuity), 31.47% are dissatisfied, and 20.81% are unsure. Also, the overall mean of satisfaction concerning job security was 4.13 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 1.91. Such a low level of JS is the second lowest among all external factors. In light of the data, the conclusion of a low level of JS among faculty members in private VTE institutions in the Baabda district is confirmed, concerning the degree of job security. This low satisfaction with job stability among Lebanese instructors is magnified further by the economic downturn that Lebanon is suffering from (Rkein et al., 2022). The worst of Lebanon’s crisis is because “Lebanese stakeholders including stockholders and investors got disappointed with their banks’ behavior during the crisis” (p. 56). A fact that created negative feelings as asserted by Yassin (2020), Saoud (2021), and Barbuscia (2021). Lebanese employees including faculty and teachers (full-time and part-time) are suffering because of the very low salaries received due to the crisis leading to dissatisfaction and feelings of depression. The aforementioned is magnified further by the work environment weaknesses in infrastructure, funds limitations to support blended education, loss of rewards for faculty members, and unavailable funds for training and development (UNEVOC, 2005; Karam, 2006).

SQ4. What is the nature of the relationship between JS and the organizational environment of teachers in private VTE institutions in Lebanon in the Baabda District?

The mean of job satisfaction considering the physical (external) dimensions at work (i.e., satisfaction with the work environment, the relationship with colleagues, the performance of the direct manager, etc.) is 4.71 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 1.79. Also, the overall job satisfaction average for the eight (8) external factors is 64.09%, while the minimum value is 45.69% and the maximum value is 90.70%. Moreover, Table 9 shows the categorization of the extent of the instructors’ satisfaction considering individual external elements. Only three (3) items scored “somewhat satisfied” and the remaining five (5) items were about neutral. In light of the previous results, the conclusion of a low level

of JS among teachers in private VTE institutions in the Baabda district is confirmed concerning the organizational environment.

Table 10. Respondents' JS versus Organizational Environment (External Factors)

No.	Statement	Type	Somewhat Satisfied	high-end neutral	marginally neutral
1	The physical work conditions	External			x
3	One's fellow workers	External	x		
5	One's immediate boss	External	x		
7	One's rate of pay	External			x
9	Industrial relations between management and workers in one's firm	External	x		
11	The way one's firm is managed	External		x	
13	One's hours of work	External		x	
15	One's job security	External			x

Furthermore, it is worth mentioning that the results also show that the overall mean for the external items is higher than the mean for the internal items. This behavior fits Bakotić's (2016) results. Such results reflect that the work environment, the relationships with colleagues, and the performance of the direct managers among others, impact the participants' job satisfaction more than the internal factors. The results obtained by Hashem, Sfeir, Hejase & Hejase (2022) confirm similar participants' behavior recording a minimum satisfaction with pay, average satisfaction with the relationship between management and instructors in the school, and maximum satisfaction with fellow instructors. These items were classified as part of the affective feeling component of employee engagement which according to Towers Perrin (2015), "taps into whether employees have a sense of belonging and pride in the company" (p. 8). In conclusion for this question, results support that a positive marginal correlation exists between job satisfaction and the organizational environment for faculty members.

SQ5. Is there a statistically significant relationship between job satisfaction and teachers' demographic variables (like gender, age, educational level, social status, years of experience, income rate, social benefits, ...)?

This question leads to the formulation of a null hypothesis to be tested.

4.2.1 Hypothesis Testing

The null hypothesis H_0 represents a claim to be tested about certain concepts or selected features of society. Therefore, the main objective in hypothesis testing is to test the validity of the null hypothesis at a selected probability significance level, in this case, 95%, therefore, a standard error $\alpha=5\%$ is selected.

To test the hypothesis of this study, the (Spearman) test was employed to assess the extent of a statistically significant relationship between JS among teachers in selected private VTE institutions in the district of Baabda, and the teachers' demographic variables. If the value of $\alpha > 0.05$, it indicates a strong correlation between the selected variables by rejecting the null hypotheses.

Null Hypothesis-H₀: There are no statistically significant differences in JS among faculty members due to demographic variables (i.e., sex (gender), educational level, social status, years of experience, and average income).

Table 11. Testing the Relationships between JS and Gender; Marital Status

Sex	Frequency	Mean	Standard Deviation	P-value
Male	83	4.57	1.152	0.195
Female	117	4.79	1.161	
Marital Status				
Single	84	4.61	1.057	0.347
Married	116	4.76	1.228	

Table 11 shows that there is no statistically significant relationship between the general mean of JS and gender ($P=0.195 > \alpha=0.05$). Thus, the hypothesis that there are no statistically significant differences in JS among teachers attributable to gender is confirmed. Vrontis, El Chaarani, El Nemar & Yamak (2019) obtained a similar result.

Also, Table 10 shows that there is no statistically significant relationship between the general rate of JS and social (marital) status ($P=0.347 > \alpha=0.05$). Thus, the hypothesis that there are no statistically significant differences in JS among teachers due to social status is confirmed.

Table 12. Testing the Relationship between JS and Academic Level

Educ.	Frequency	Mean	Standard Deviation	P-value
Ph.D.	7	5.04	0.557	
MS/MA	64	4.72	0.999	
Certif.	22	4.36	1.265	0.505
BS/BA	90	4.77	1.282	
Tech. Spec.	17	4.50	1.066	

Table 12 shows that the relationship between the general rate of JS and the education level has no statistical significance ($P=0.505 > \alpha=0.05$). Thus, the hypothesis that there are no statistically significant differences in JS among teachers attributable to education level is confirmed.

Table 13. Testing the Relationships between JS and Years of Experience, Salary

Years of Exp.	Frequency	Mean	Standard Deviation	P-value
<5 years	100	4.76	0.996	
5-10 years	50	4.74	1.209	0.489
>10 years	50	4.53	1.397	
Monthly Salary, USD				
	Frequency	Mean	Standard Deviation	P-value
<500	96	4.56	0.944	
Between 500 & 1000	75	4.77	1.321	0.207
>1000	29	4.96	1.327	

Table 13 shows the relationship between the general rate of JS and the years of experience has no statistical significance ($P=0.489>\alpha=0.05$). Thus, the hypothesis that there are no statistically significant differences in JS among teachers due to years of experience is confirmed. This finding is conformant with the work by Castillo and Cano (2004). Similarly, Table 12 confirms there is no statistically significant relationship between the general rate of JS and the average monthly income ($P=0.207>\alpha=0.05$). The hypothesis that there are no statistically significant differences in JS among teachers due to the average monthly income is confirmed. This result conforms to the results obtained by Vrontis et al. (2019).

5. Conclusion and Recommendations

This section deals with a presentation of the most prominent conclusions that have been reached, in addition to some recommendations and suggestions.

First: the most important conclusions

In the light of statistical analysis and hypothesis testing, the study reached the following results:

- There is a low overall mean of JS for the sample surveyed, i.e., its value is 4.69 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 1.15.
- The largest percentage of the surveyed sample is not satisfied with the wages they receive, as the general mean of satisfaction with wages paid was 3.83 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 2.00.
- There is a low level of JS among teachers in private VTE institutions in the Baabda district concerning the degree of job security, as it reached 4.13 out of 7 points, with a standard deviation of 1.91.
- The study also showed that there are no statistically significant differences in JS among teachers due to demographics (gender, educational level, social (marital) status, years of experience, and income).

5.1 Recommendations and Suggestions (with a Background to Increase Job Satisfaction)

The teachers' job satisfaction is one of the most important factors that affect their performance, and increasing job satisfaction to a higher level requires great effort and time (Al-Zoubi, 2011, p. 81).

Improvement requires benchmarking with best practices and following suit with known performers. This paper aimed to assess two main questions applied to the Baabda District:

- How can the extent of teachers' job satisfaction in private institutes be raised, and
- What are the job satisfaction effects on the quality of educational services in these institutes?

5.1.1 How Can the Extent of Teachers' Job Satisfaction in Private Institutes be Raised?

The best way to address the first question is to consider the external and internal factors that scored the lowest means and were classified as marginally neutral (see Table 4). These factors that cause dissatisfaction have to be prioritized to draw appropriate recommendations and at the same time consider the facts impacting the progress of vocational and technical schools in Lebanon. Exhibits 1 and 2 illustrate the challenges that have been accumulating since 1999 till present.

Exhibit 1: The main challenges facing the system (1999)

- A. Inadequate private provision of technical training.**
- B. Absence of a regulatory mechanism that ensures the quality of the training** offered by private institutions.
- C. The structure** of the system of technical education and vocational training is fairly appropriate for long technical education, but poor for initial vocational training.
- D. The growing mismatch between the inflexible curricula currently being implemented and the quality needs of enterprises** in all sectors.
- E. The methods and technologies used for education and training are outdated** and rely on poorly trained teaching bodies.
- F. The refocusing of the VTE system on the production sector** cannot take place without *the involvement of social partners*.
- G. Little development of continuing training.** Although employers are demanding this kind of training, they are doing so in a fairly halfhearted way.
- H. Deficient system for monitoring certificate holders impedes** the integration of certificate holders and blurs the match between education and employment.

Source: European Training Foundation & Akl, J., 1999, p. 10.

Exhibit 2: The main challenges facing the system (2018-2022)

- I. Access and service delivery**
1. Students and families' negative views toward enrollment in VTET.
 2. Programs are not inclusive.
 3. Continuous existence of a weak infrastructure.
- II. Quality and relevance**
1. The relevance of TVET to the labor market demand is weak.
 2. Lack of more qualified trainers, staff, and supervisors.
- III. Governance and systems**
1. No common priorities for TVET.
 2. Centralized financing system is not planned according to actual cost-effective approaches.
 3. Partnerships between TVET institutions with the private sector are not enough.

Source: ILO, 2018, pp. 20-21.

The UNICEF–ILO, in 2017, signed a partnership with the Lebanese Government offering extensive consultations with various stakeholders to establish “a common roadmap for reforming the TVET system” (ILO, 2018, p. 20). Three main areas summarized the challenges affecting TVET’s progress observed in Exhibit 2. Also, one can assert that several items are still considered challenges since 1999, i.e., undeveloped curricula, infrastructure, poorly trained teaching staff, etc.

Exhibits 1 and 2 demonstrate that the teaching staff is functioning under outdated systems, inadequate infrastructure, poor curricula, and deficient training for students due to traditional tools and technologies, besides the many demotivating internal and external factors that many were tested in this research. Consequently, the challenging intensity to increase the teaching staff’s job satisfaction is high. In addition, providing sound recommendations is commensurate with the private TVET institutions and the current leadership’s actions to implement change in the available external factors and the existing updated human resource departments’ readiness to boost opportunities to influence positively internal factors.

Based on the results of this research, prioritization of internal factors seeking their improvement goes as follows:

10	Chance of promotion	[Marginally Neutral]	(High Priority)
8	Opportunity to use own abilities	[High-end Neutral]	(Moderate)
12	The attention paid to suggestions made	[High-end Neutral]	(Moderate)
14	Job variety	[High-end Neutral]	(Moderate)

The Human Resources (HR) department in private vocational and training institutions needs to provide transparent, clear, and structured internal promotion schemes that lead to rewarding teachers with high-performance opportunities for tenure or full-time jobs. Especially that recorded data show a rate of 1 to 5 full-time (16.67%) to part-time (83.33%) distribution of the faculty across Lebanon and across private and public institutions (Sarah, 2021). Moreover, the HR department needs to review the “Job Characteristic Model” components related to job variety, empowerment, and feedback so that the teaching faculty have opportunities to operationalize their skills, knowledge, and abilities. This way, the faculty will be able to engage further and feel more appreciated leading to higher JS and performance (Hejase, 2019).

On the other hand, the results related to external factors of this research showed three different categories of job satisfaction. Herein, these factors are labeled according to their priority for improvement.

1	Physical work conditions	[Marginally Neutral]	(High Priority)
7	Rate of pay	[Marginally Neutral]	(High Priority)
15	Job security	[Marginally Neutral]	(High Priority)
11	The firm’s management style	[High-end Neutral]	
13	Number of hours of work	[High-end Neutral]	
3	Fellow workers	[Somewhat satisfied]	
5	Immediate boss	[Somewhat satisfied]	
9	Relationships between workers & management in the firm	[Somewhat satisfied]	

Results showed that the respondents' work status is 47.5% full-time and 52.5% part-time employees. Items 1, 7, and 15 resulted from the full-timers and the part-timers' opinions. As shown in Exhibits 1 and 2, the teaching faculty's weaknesses are salient, especially in their career development and their continuous training and development. Items 1, 11, 13, and 15 are related to the HR department policies and the leaders' efforts to upgrade their schools' premises and current operating systems. However, the continuous crises in Lebanon and the present downturn of the political, financial, economic, and social capabilities (Yassin, 2020; Saoud, 2021; Barbuscia, 2021) have prevented private vocational and technical institutions to act proactively. Such institutions, among others, lack the necessary financial support causing them to limit their efforts to maintain, upgrade, and expand their work physical conditions, salary schemes, training and development programs, and the potential to offer the faculty more secure jobs.

Items 3, 5, and 9 were labeled somewhat satisfactory by the participants in this research. These items depend more on the teachers-employer, teacher-administrative staff, and teacher-teacher relationships that are positive and governed by common societal problems leading to creating a work culture characterized by empathy and understanding. Therefore, leads to more job satisfaction empowered by humane relationships and collegiality.

Below the researchers provide some applied methods for increasing job satisfaction in all aspects (external or internal). Such methods are similar to the work of ready-made, tried-and-true recipes that have met with success in many organizations and led to a good increase in job satisfaction rates (Al-Zoubi, 2011, pp. 82-96).

I-A Program to increase social relations between co-workers

This program aims to improve social working relationships between colleagues so that they become based on professional working relationships. Here are some ideas that can be applied.

- Training employees on protocols for dealing with colleagues. This is often performed using work induction sessions.
- Organizing social and group activities (special dinners and celebrating high performers).
- Increasing employee-employee knowledge sharing.
- Encouraging colleagues to cover each other in case one of them needs a vacation or is leaving.
- Forming a social committee whose task is to congratulate employees on their happy occasions or comfort them on their painful events.
- Forming a social solidarity fund to which the institution should contribute.

II-A Program to improve the quality of relations between teachers and administrators. This leads teachers to more enthusiasm and dedication to work considering the qualities of committed and dedicated faculty members (Todea et al., 2022).

- Provide a transparent, just, and fair system. The worst thing that can cause a grudge is the lack of a sense of nonbias, justice, and fairness.
- Creating an appreciative culture.
- Paying attention to the employees' needs and meeting them as much as possible.
- Consultation with employees before starting implementation.
- Not to resort to sanctions only after exhausting other options.
- Good listening to their opinions and suggestions.

III-A program for improving physical working conditions

Usop et al. (2013), Vrontis et al. (2019), and other researchers have indicated that individuals who work in a comfortable work environment have higher rates of job satisfaction. Some ideas for improving the physical work environment are:

- Having enough space to perform the work.
- Availability of good ventilation that allows normal breathing.
- The presence of moderate temperature in the work environment.
- Furniture and work tools should be compatible with human specifications and standards.
- Provide appropriate lighting.

IV-A program to increase the sense of justice for wages

The salary increase does not achieve job satisfaction except on a temporary basis since the effect almost fades out within four years (Chamberlain, 2017; Diriwaechter & Shvartsman, 2018; The University of Basel, 2018). An employee quickly gets used to the new allowance and begins to complain about the lack of wages again. Organizations should seek to achieve a sense of wage fairness and not satisfaction with wages.

Suggestions include

- If the organization's wages are higher than its counterparts, focus on this matter and highlight it to all employees in a clear and simplified manner.
- If, on the other hand, the organization's wages are slightly less than their counterparts, the focus must be placed on other aspects that may be beneficial to the employee or worker and are not available in other organizations.
- If the wages are significantly lower in comparison to similar organizations, it is better to increase wages since it is difficult in such cases to build a positive comparisons.

V-A Job Security Increase Program

Employees who work in an environment where they feel they are subject to dismissal without warning or for trivial reasons are often frightened and dissatisfied employees. "It is the culture and values of the organization, followed closely by the quality of senior leadership and the career opportunities at the company" (Chamberlain, 2017, para 5). Research by Nemteanu, Dinu & Dabija (2021) indicates that unstable and fearful individuals have a poor commitment and low satisfaction even if their wages are high:

Some ideas to be applied are the following:

- The employee must be aware of a transparent, clear, and simple system for dismissal and termination of services.
- The power of dismissal must not be linked to one person. It must take place in stages because this gives a feeling that there is an institutional presence at work and that the dismissal is not based on personal whims.

VI-An increasing feedback program at work

The concept of feedback refers to employees obtaining information about their performance and the opinion of others on how they performed the required tasks (Robinson, 2022). Suggested ideas are:

- Emphasis should be placed on giving positive and negative feedback and not only the negative ones.
- In the event of negative feedback, feedback on performance should be given in a friendly manner and appear in the form of advice or recommendation, especially the first time that a note of this kind is given on the employee's performance.

- Make sure that the positive comments are public and the negative comments are private between you and the employee only because your goal is reform and not punishment.
- Encourage colleagues to give feedback on their colleagues' performance.

5.1.2 What Are the Effects of the Teachers' Job Satisfaction on the Quality of Educational Services in these Institutes?

According to UNESCO (2014), "good quality education and training for all depend upon the provision of sufficient numbers of trained teachers, incentivizing them to make a long-term commitment, and deploying them to those areas and learners that need them most" (p. 22). Therefore, having motivated and incentivized teachers or faculty members will impact the quality of education. For example, Gkolia, Belias & Koustelios (2014) contend that teaching faculty who have job satisfaction, who are professionally capable, and who feel they possess enough management, organization, and good performance in their teaching endeavors, will perform better with students. In addition, Budhathoki (2021) asserts "teacher satisfaction is useful for the school effectiveness and development... When the teachers are satisfied with all the aspects within their workplace, only then they would be able to provide a significant contribution in efficiently performing their job duties" (p. 85).

Moreover, increasing job satisfaction for vocational teachers with several activities for example, "job transfer to different convenient locations, peer assistance, continuous educational training, refreshing and elevating their knowledge, skills, ability, and experience" (Daryanto, 2016, p. 239) will increase their commitment to perform their existing professional jobs. Consequently, students will benefit from their teachers' knowledge, experience, and positive attitude to share job networks and connections in the marketplace. As marked by Rivera (2021), "The efficiency of teachers contributes to the success of the school's goals since the teachers will exert more effort in achieving their work responsibilities, which promotes quality education" (p. 159).

References

- Alawnah, M. (2006). Measuring the level of job satisfaction and organizational loyalty and the relationship between them among private school teachers in the city of Nablus. *Proceedings of the Conference: The Teacher in the Third Millennium*. May 17-18, 2006. Al-Isra University, Amman, Jordan [In Arabic].
- Al-Dubai, M. M., Gopalan, V., Alaghbari, M. A., & Hamood, A. M. (2019). The moderating role of job satisfaction on the relationship between human resource management practices and employee performance among telecommunications employees. *Journal of Internet Banking and Commerce*, 24(2), 1-22.
- Al-Khatib, M. (1995). *The General Principles of Technical and Vocational Education: A Study of Technical and Vocational Education Strategy and Its Problems*. Philosophical and Social Origins and Curriculum Origins, Arab Bureau of Education for the Gulf States, Saudi Arabia [In Arabic].
- Al-Reeh, G. A. F. (2018). *Job Satisfaction of Teachers at Base Stage and its Impact on Professional Performance Improvement: Case study: Aljawda School for Basic Education, Khartoum* (Master's thesis). College of Graduate Studies, Deanship of Development and Quality, Sudan University of Science and Technology [In Arabic].
- Al-Wahidi, M. (2000). *The Relationship between the Organizational Climate in Public Schools and Job Satisfaction among Teachers of the Higher Primary Classes in Ramallah and Al-Bireh Governorate* (Unpublished Master's Thesis, p. 63). Bir Zeit University, Palestine.

- Al-Zoubi, M. (2011). *Job satisfaction, its concept, methods of measuring it, interpretation of its grades, and methods of increasing it at work*. Amman, Jordan: Dar Al Masirah for Publishing, Distribution, and Printing [In Arabic].
- Antoncic, J. A., & Antoncic, B. (2011). Employee satisfaction, intrapreneurship, and firm growth: A model. *Industrial Management and Data Systems*, 111(4), 589-607. <https://doi.org/10.1108/02635571111133560>
- Bagal, S. (2015). Technical Education and Vocational Training for Sustainable Development. *Journal of Training and Development*, 1(1), 15-20. <https://doi.org/10.3126/jtd.v1i1.13085>
- Bakotić, D. (2016). Relationship between job satisfaction and organisational performance. *Economic Research-Ekonomska Istraživanja*, 29(1), 118-130. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2016.1163946>
- Barbuscia, D. (2021, June 17). Financial surrealism: Lebanese opt for beer over banks. *Reuters*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://www.reuters.com/world/middle-east/financial-surrealism-lebanese-opt-beer-over-banks-2021-06-17/>
- Berri, H. (2022). We were faced with two options, either to raise the fees or cancel the exams. *Tarbaweya: Daily Educational Report March 2, 2022*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from <https://tarbaweya.org/essaydetails.php?eid=14971&cid=554&pid=0>
- Booyesen, C. (2008). *A Study of the relationship between job satisfaction experienced by employees within a retail company and their organizational citizenship behavior* (Master's Thesis). Department of Industrial Psychology, Faculty of Economics and Management Sciences, University of the Western Cape, Cape Town, South Africa.
- Budhathoki, J. K. (2021). Teachers' Satisfaction: Implications for Job Performance. *Interdisciplinary Research in Education*, 6(2), 79-88. <https://doi.org/10.3126/ire.v6i2.43540>
- Castillo, J. X., & Cano, J. (2004). Factors Explaining Job Satisfaction among Faculty. *Journal of Agricultural Education*, 45(3), 65-74. <https://doi.org/10.5032/jae.2004.03065>
- Chamberlain, A. (2017). What Matters More to Your Workforce than Money. *Harvard Business Review*, January 17, 2017. Retrieved October 9, 2022, from <https://hbr.org/2017/01/what-matters-more-to-your-workforce-than-money>
- Chehimi, G. M., Hejase, A. J., & Hejase, N. H. (2019). An Assessment of Lebanese Companies' Motivators to Adopt CSR Strategies. *Open Journal of Business and Management*, 7, 1891-1925. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ojbm.2019.74130>
- City Facts. (2022). *Baabda*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://www.city-facts.com/baabda>
- CRDP. (2019, November). *Statistical Bulletin: Vocational and technical education for the academic year 2016-2017*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from <https://www.crdp.org/sites/default/files/2019-11/3.4.pdf>
- CRDP. (2021, June). *Statistical Bulletin: Vocational and technical education for the academic year 2019-2020*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from https://www.crdp.org/sites/default/files/2021-06/Stat_Nashra_Inside_2020_V_5_0.pdf
- Daryanto, E. (2016). A Study on Vocational School Teachers' Satisfaction in Deli Serdang North Sumatera Indonesia. *International Journal of Sciences: Basic and Applied Research (IJSBAR)* 27, (1), 229-243. Retrieved October 6, 2022, from <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/249335234.pdf>

- Diriwaechter, P., & Shvartsman, E. (2018). The anticipation and adaptation effects of intra- and interpersonal wage changes on job satisfaction. *Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization*, 146, 116-140. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2017.12.010>
- Edu-Leb.net (2021). Directory of the public technical institutes and schools in Lebanon. *Ministry of Education and Higher Education: General Directorate of Vocational and Technical Education*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://edu-lb.net/schoolrasmelist.php>
- European Training Foundation, & Akl, J. (1999). Overview of vocational training and education in Lebanon. *European Training Foundation*. Retrieved October 5, 2022, from https://www.etf.europa.eu/sites/default/files/m/C12578310056925BC125700D004005FA_MED_VET_Lebanon_00_EN.pdf
- Fallata, M. M. I. (1994). *Preparing a teacher of vocational and technical education in the Arab Gulf states*. A study commissioned by the Arab Bureau of Education for the Gulf States. Riyadh, Saudi Arabia: Arab Bureau of Education for the Gulf States.
- Fatima, A., & Saleem, R. (2016). The Impact of Vocational Education on Economic Growth of Pakistan. *Bulletin of Business and Economics*, 5(2), 83-91.
- Friday, S. S., & Friday, E. (2003). Racioethnic perceptions of Job characteristics and Job satisfaction. *Journal of Management Development*, 22(5), 426-442. <https://doi.org/10.1108/02621710310474778>
- Fuwawi, E. F. (2007). *Job satisfaction and its relationship to organizational commitment among male and female educational supervisors in the Department of Education in the Holy City of Makkah* (Master's thesis). College of Education, Umm Al-Qura University, Makka, Saudi Arabia [In Arabic].
- Ghneim, O. (2018). Work-Based Learning Study Reviewing Work-Based Learning (WBL) Programmes for Young People in Lebanon. *UNESCO & Welfare Association for Research and Development—WARD*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from https://en.unesco.org/sites/default/files/lb_0.pdf
- Ginzberg, E., Ginsburg, S. W., Axelrad, S., & Herma, J. L. (1951). *Occupational choice: An Approach to a General Theory*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- GIZ. (2019). *Employment and Labour Market Analysis in Lebanon*. The Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit GmbH, (GIZ). Retrieved September 10, 2022, from https://www.giz.de/en/downloads/ELMA_Lebanon_2019.pdf
- Gkolia, A., Belias, D., & Koustelios, A. (2014). Teachers' job satisfaction and self-efficacy: A review. *European Scientific Journal*, 10(22), 321-342.
- Hashem, M., Sfeir, E., Hejase, H. J., & Hejase, A. J. (2022). Effect of Online Training on Employee Engagement during the COVID-19 Era. *Asian Business Research*, 7(5), 10-40. <https://doi.org/10.20849/abr.v7i5.1294>
- Heathfield, S. M. (2020). Why Human Resources Management Is So Important. *The Balance Careers*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from <https://www.thebalancecareers.com/what-is-the-importance-of-human-resources-management-1917588>
- Hejase, A. J., & Hejase, H. J. (2013). *Research Methods: A Practical Approach for Business Students* (2nd ed.). Philadelphia, PA, USA: Masadir Inc.

- Hejase, H. J. (2019). *Job Characteristic Model*. Faculty of Business Administration Seminar Series-Al Maaref University, August 8, 2019. Retrieved October 6, 2022, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/335079242_Job_Characteristic_Model_Hejase_2019
- Hejase, H. J., & Chehimi, G. M. (2021). Preparing the Instructor's Teaching & Learning Competencies [Powerpoint]. *Workshop: Training of New Instructors in Teaching & Learning*. July 23, 2021. Al Maaref University, Beirut, Lebanon. Retrieved September 20, 2022, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/353402251_Preparing_the_Instructor's_Teaching_Learning_Competencies
- Hejase, H. J., Hejase, A. J., & Hejase, H. A. N. (2012). *Quantitative Methods for Decisions Makers: Management Approach* (1st ed.). Beirut: Dar Sader Publishers.
- Hopenhayn, M. (2006, February). Education during a Time of Change: A Latin American Perspective. *PRELAC Journal*, (2), 212-25. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000145878_eng
- ILO. (2018). National Strategic Framework for Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Lebanon, 2018-2022. *International Labour Organization (ILO)*. Retrieved September 20, 2022, from https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms_633487.pdf
- Kanso, G. M. (1999). *Vocational education in Lebanon from the Ottoman era until today, its position in the educational structure, its specializations, and its current connection to the labor market* (Master's thesis). Saint Joseph University, Lebanon.
- Kanso, G. M. (2006). *School Administration in Vocational Education Institutions in Lebanon: Its Current Status and Development* (Ph.D. Thesis). Saint Joseph University, Lebanon.
- Karam, G. (2006). Vocational and technical education in Lebanon: Strategic issues and challenges. *International Education Journal*, 7(3), 259-272.
- Kompass. (2022). *Baabda: Education and Training Institutions*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from https://lb.kompass.com/a/education-and-training/86/d/baabda/lb_lbjl_10/
- Kusku, F. (2003). Employee satisfaction in higher education: The case of academic and administrative staff in Turkey. *Career Development International*, 8(7), 347-356. <https://doi.org/10.1108/13620430310505304>
- Levinmichael, V., & Pela, W. (2021, April 16). What we've been reading: How to improve technical and vocational education and training for youth in developing countries [Blog]. *The World Bank*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from <https://blogs.worldbank.org/jobs/what-weve-been-reading-how-improve-technical-and-vocational-education-and-training-youth>
- Macmillan Education. (2022, May 31). The Importance of Vocational Training for Career Development [Blog]. *Macmillan Education India Pvt. Ltd*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from <https://macmillaneducation.in/blog/the-importance-of-vocational-training-for-career-development/>
- MEHE. (2022). The Lebanese Education System. *Ministry of Education and Higher Education-MEHE*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from <https://www.mehe.gov.lb/ar/Pages/Structure/Higher%20EDU/EducSys.aspx>

- Melián-González, S., Bulchand-Gidumal, J., & López-Valcárcel, B. J. (2015). New evidence of the relationship between employee satisfaction and firm economic performance. *Personnel Review*, 44(6), 906-929. <https://doi.org/10.1108/PR-01-2014-0023>
- Namaziandost, E., Inayat, W., & Jahanzeb, K. M. (2021). A Study of Job Satisfaction and Its Effect on the Performance of Employees Working in Private Sector Organizations, Peshawar. *Hindawi: Education Research International*, 2021(Article ID 1751495), 1-9. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2021/1751495>
- Nasser, H. J. (2019, June 16). Job Satisfaction among Vocational Teachers “Baabda Region as a Model”. *Cultural Papers, Journal of Arts and Humanities*, 1(2) [in Arabic]. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from http://www.awraqthaqafya.com/302/#_ftnref5
- Nemteanu, M.-S., Dinu, V., & Dabija, D.-C. (2021). Job Insecurity, Job Instability, and Job Satisfaction in the Context of the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Journal of Competitiveness*, 13(2), 65-82. <https://doi.org/10.7441/joc.2021.02.04>
- Pavlova, M. (2014, December 4). TVET as an important factor in a country’s economic development. *Springerplus*, 3(Suppl 1), K3. <https://doi.org/10.1186/2193-1801-3-S1-K3>
- Peters, J. H. (n.d.). The importance of vocational training for career development [Blog]. *Equal Housing Lender (EHL) Insights-Swiss School of Tourism and Hospitality*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from <https://hospitalityinsights.ehl.edu/vocational-training-career-development>
- Rivera, F. B. (2021). The Leadership Styles of School Heads in Bayugan North and Northwest Districts and the Efficiency of Teachers. *SMCC Higher Education Research Journal*, 8(January), 148-161. <https://doi.org/10.18868/sherj8j.08.010121.11>
- Rkein, H. I., Hejase, H. J., Rkein, A., Hejase, A. J., & Fayyad-Kazan, H. (2022). The Use of Banks’ Financial Statements by Depositors and the Impact on Their Decision-Making: A Case from Lebanon. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 13(3), 1-11.
- Robinson, E. (2022, August 18). Why employee feedback is important and how to give and receive it [Blog]. *Hotjar*. Retrieved October 9, 2022, from <https://www.hotjar.com/blog/employee-feedback/>
- Saari, L. M., & Judge, T. A. (2004). Employee Attitudes and Job Satisfaction. *Human Resource Management*, 43(4), 395-407. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hrm.20032>
- Saoud, D. (2021, December 21). Depositors turn to courts to free money from Lebanese banks. *United Press International*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from https://www.upi.com/Top_News/World-News/2021/12/21/lebanon-Lebanon-frozen-bank-accounts-lawsuits/5221640106629/
- Sarah. (2021, September 11). Vocational education in Lebanon [Blog]. *Zyadda*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://www.zyadda.com/vocational-education-in-lebanon/>
- Scholaro. (2022). *The Education System in Lebanon*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from <https://www.scholaro.com/db/Countries/Lebanon/Education-System>
- SENAI. (2015). International Overview of Vocational Education: Challenges and Replies. *SENAI—Departamento Nacional, Brasilia-2015*. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from https://static.portaldaindustria.com.br/media/filer_public/cd/51/cd5148dc-8df7-47e0-be12-2311c2341cc2/international_overview_of_vocational_education_senai.pdf
- Symonds, G. (2022, August 5). HR Guide: Increasing Organizational Commitment [Blog]. *Factorial HR*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://factorialhr.com/blog/organizational-commitment/>

- The University of Basel. (2018, February 7). Wage increases do not have a persistent effect on job satisfaction. *Science Daily*. Retrieved October 9, 2022, from <http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2018/02/180207120637.htm>
- Todea, S., Davidescu, A. A., Pop, N. A., & Stamule, T. (2022). Determinants of Student Loyalty in Higher Education: A Structural Equation Approach for the Bucharest University of Economic Studies, Romania. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*, 19(9), 5527. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19095527>
- Toker, B. (2011). Job satisfaction of academic staff: An empirical study on Turkey. *Quality Assurance in Education*, 19(2), 156-169. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09684881111125050>
- Training Industry. (2022). *Vocational Training*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://trainingindustry.com/glossary/vocational-training/>
- UNESCO. (2014). Technical and Vocational Teachers and Trainers in the Arab Region: A Review of Policies and Practices on Continuous Professional Development. *UNESDOC Digital Library: ED-2014/WS/39 REV*. Retrieved October 6, 2022, from <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000231160?posInSet=5&queryId=N-EXPLORE-b4d9d8ed-75de-4438-989e-ec3955f4959a>
- UNEVOC. (2005). Vocational education: The come-back? *Education Today*, (13), April-June 2005. UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training UNEVOC. Retrieved September 10, 2022, from https://unevoc.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/pubs/VocEdSpecial_en.pdf
- UNHCR. (2021). *Mount Lebanon*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://www.unhcr.org/lb/mount-lebanon-beirut>
- UNICEF. (2020). *TVET Study Map: The educational map of the public technical institutes and schools. UNICEF and International Information Company*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://www.unicef.org/lebanon/ar/media/8291/file>
- Usop, A. M., Askandar, K., Langguyuan-Kadtong, M., & Usop, D. A. S. O. (2013). Work Performance and Job Satisfaction among Teachers. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 3(5), 245-252.
- Vrontis, D., El Charani, H., El Nemar, S., & Yamak, B. (2019). Determinants of job satisfaction in the Lebanese construction sector. *J. Global Business Advancement*, 12(4), 516-541. <https://doi.org/10.1504/JGBA.2019.103318>
- Warr, P. (1999). Well-being and the Workplace. In D. Kahneman, E. Diener, & N. Schwarz (Eds.), *Well-being: The foundations of Hedonic Psychology* (pp. 392-412). Russell Sage Foundation.
- Warr, P. J., Cook, J., & Wall, T. (1979). Scales for the measurement of some work attitudes and aspects of psychological well-being. *Journal of Occupational Organizational Psychology*, 52(2), 129-148. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2044-8325.1979.tb00448.x>
- Weiss, H. M. (2002). Deconstructing job satisfaction: Separating evaluations, beliefs, and affective experiences. *Human Resource Management Review*, 12(2), 173-194. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1053-4822\(02\)00045-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1053-4822(02)00045-1)
- World Atlas. (2022). *Map of Lebanon*. Retrieved September 22, 2022, from <https://www.worldatlas.com/maps/lebanon>

- Yassin, H. (2020, April 12). How a “Haircut” Could Affect Your Money in the Bank in Lebanon. *The 961.com*. Retrieved September 25, 2022, from <https://www.the961.com/haircut-could-affect-your-money/Z>
- Yassin, I. (2003). *The Organizational and Professional Commitment of Teachers in Ramallah Governorate* (Unpublished Master’s Thesis). Bir Zeit University, Palestine.
- Younis, J. A., Hejase, H. J., Dalal, H. R., Hejase, A. J., & Frimousse, S. (2022). Leaderships’ Role in Managing Crisis in the Lebanese Health Sector: An Assessment of Influencing Factors. *Research in Health Science*, 7(3), 54-97. <https://doi.org/10.22158/rhs.v7n3p54>
- Zoughaib, A., El Achi, S., El Dirani, A., & Hejase, H. J. (2021). The Predominant Factors Affecting Frontline Employees’ Engagement: Case of the Lebanese Service Sector. *Journal of Business Theory and Practice*, 9(2), 37-67. <https://doi.org/10.22158/jbtp.v9n2p37>