

Original Paper

Professional Development of Music Teacher in China: Practice and Challenges

Duan Yuexin¹

¹ Jiancaoping District People's Government of Taiyuan City, Shanxi 030003, China

Received: September 25, 2021 Accepted: October 10, 2021 Online Published: October 27, 2021

doi:10.22158/jetss.v3n3p44

URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.22158/jetss.v3n3p44>

Abstract

Since 2001, national basic education curriculum reforms have been instituting to meet the demands of quality-oriented education in China. Due to this nationwide reform proposed to cultivate students' moral, intellectual, physical and aesthetic development, music education which is a vital component of aesthetic education has received considerable critical attention from Chinese government. In the last two decades, the argument of significance of teachers' professional development (PD) in curriculum reform has led a growing trend towards practice aimed to promote PD of music teachers in China. This paper presents an analysis of challenges the music teacher PD practice has met. Based on the discussion, it must be suggested that policymakers, school principals, PD program providers should increase attention to the effectiveness of music teacher PD programs and take available measures. This paper contributes to ongoing discussions about factors to be considered in designing PD programs for music teachers in countries or societies under the influence of Confucian culture. Potential areas of further work include exploring the factors restricting the effectiveness of music teacher PD programs in China and the framework of high-quality PD program for music teachers in the context of Confucian culture.

Keywords

music teacher, professional development, China, practice and challenges

1. Education Reform and Aesthetic Education in China

At the turn of the new millennium, the People's Republic of China launched its eighth education reform, which is regarded as the most radical and far-reaching education reform in the 21st century of China (Ryan et al., 2009; Tan, 2016). The official document that implemented the education reform, *Outline of the Curriculum Reform for Basic Education (Trial)*, claimed that it is a decade-long curriculum reform designed to better accommodate its booming socio-economic development and improve

international competitiveness (MOE, 2001). The Chinese government has stated that the goal of the eighth curriculum reform is to implement quality-oriented education, cultivating globally competitive citizens with all-round development in the moral, intellectual, physical and aesthetic (MOE, 2001). As a result, aesthetic education occupies an important position in Chinese K-12 curriculum system and is viewed to be an indispensable part of primary and secondary school education. A series of aesthetic education reform policies have been published by Chinese government. Accordingly, the number of aesthetic education courses was determined to account for nine to eleven percent of their total hours in primary and secondary schools in China (MOE, 2008). In the latest aesthetic education policy, the Chinese education officials declared that China is committed to incorporate aesthetic education subjects in the Chinese High School Entrance Examination (Zhongkao), promising to comprehensively strengthen and improve aesthetic education in schools (MOE, 2020).

2. Music Education and Music Teacher in China

Aesthetic education comprises seven subjects of which the music education is one (MOE, 2020). Music has existed in ancient China, when it was always regarded as a political tool (Ho, 2010). For example, the scale of the orchestra used to perform court music varied according to the rank of nobility in the Zhou Dynasty (1045-256 BC) (Xie & Lueng, 2011). In modern China, an important purpose for Chinese authorities to carry out music education is to cultivate the moral character of students (Ho, 2010). Moral education is the ultimate goal of education reform in China (Xue & Li, 2021). Therefore, music education, which is viewed as a means to promote education reform has been attached importance and supervised by the Chinese government (Law & Ho, 2009). The Chinese government has made a lot of efforts to alleviate the shortage of music and academic teachers, including: 1) publishing education initiatives to improve the social status of teachers; 2) setting up Master of Fine Arts to cultivate high-level music and artistic talents in Chinese colleges and universities; 3) encouraging schools to invite artists to offer music education in classes; 4) improving the treatment of full-time music and academic teachers, for instance, ensuring that the average salary level of primary and secondary school teachers is no lower than that of local civil servants. These attempts, to some extent, ensured an adequate supply of music teachers in China, and provided a relatively solid foundation for China's music education reform.

3. Chinese Music Teacher's PD Programs

Over the last few decades, there has been a dramatic proliferation of Asian and western research on the relationship between education reform and the teacher's PD (Choi & Walker, 2018; Crockett, 2007; Lei & Medwell, 2020; Paik et al., 2011; Starkey et al., 2009; Tao & Gao, 2017). A review of the literature and research demonstrates that teachers are the most crucial implementors of education and curriculum reform, and that PD is a central vehicle to accomplish the intentions of reform (Bain et al., 2011; Fullan, 2009; Mourshed, et al., 2010; OECD, 2015; Spillane, 2012). PD can enhance teachers' teaching skills

and knowledge (Choi, 2015; Muijs & Lindsay, 2008) as well as improve their attitudes towards and preparation for curriculum reform (Hargreaves, 2001; Scott & Sutton, 2009). In response, policy makers in various countries have considered deepening and expanding teachers' professional competence through formal and informal learning opportunities to accelerate education reform (Richter et al., 2011; Zhao, 2010). In China, a number of top-down government-led arts and academic teacher training and teaching supportive policies aimed to cascade training from "experts" to address curriculum reforms have been launched (Lei & Medwell, 2020). National Teacher Training Program (NTTP), a national demonstration project of teacher training, has given preferential support to teachers in aesthetic education, physical education, special education, and Chinese traditional culture. From 2019, the Ministry of Education has supported more than twenty Chinese universities to provide continuous assistance and volunteer services to thirty-eight rural primary and secondary schools in eighteen provinces of China in terms of arts and academic curriculum teaching. At the time of writing, as a government official working on supervising music and arts education activities in communities, I attended the fourth annual National Music Education Conference (NMEC), alongside more than 1,000 conference participants. NMEC provided participants with a wealth of learning opportunities and resources, such as lectures, workshops, as well as videos and teaching plans of music education in kindergartens, primary and secondary schools. At the opening ceremony of NMEC, a Chinese government official claimed that The NMEC has become the most influential music education conference in China. The conference on its own is an indication that Chinese government has continued to try to fulfill its voluntary commitments on promoting the PD of music teachers.

To meet curriculum reform challenges, Chinese music teachers experienced school-based inquiry-led PD training (Lei & Medwell, 2020). Previous research suggests that educators working together collaboratively and continuously can improve teaching and learning practices effectively (Reichstetter, 2006). It has been proved that a large number of Chinese arts and academic teachers attended Teaching Research Groups (jiaoyanzu, TRGs) which is equipped with the principles of Professional Learning Communities (PLCs) (Paine & Ma, 1993; Wang, 2016), and there was no exception in music teachers. Although developing PLCs was consistently found as one of the most effective strategies for school reforms (Harris, 2010; Pyhalto et al., 2011), substantial studies have been performed to show that PLCs were voluntary and loosely organized in western countries (Hargreaves, 2007; Lieberman, 2007). In some Asian countries PLCs were structured in a state-led manner, while in few countries like China they were institutionalized as a part of the school education system. Resultingly, the concept and practice of PCLs was not at the initial stage in China (Hairon & Dimmock, 2012; M. Lee & Kim, 2016). A series of studies have shown that almost all provinces and cities in mainland China have TRGs (Paine & Ma, 1993; Tsui & Wong, 2009). Usually, TRGs consist of teachers who teach the same or similar subjects in a school and seek to improve teaching practices through collective work (Paine & Ma, 1993). They need to regularly organize various professional activities, such as collective lesson preparation, open class, peer observation, action research at different levels, etc. In China, Master

Teacher Studios (MTSs) have increasingly become a popular TRGs format. Music MTSs in China are generally combined by: (1) the principal master teacher, who is responsible for the orderly operation of the studio and the successful development of various activities; (2) the master teacher team, which consists of several excellent teachers who have abundant music teaching experience; (3) trainee teachers, who need to conduct team research activities in the studio; (4) expert consultants, who provide technical support and theoretical guidance for studio activities. The member of master teacher studios should carry out research on issues related to music teaching and music teachers' PD. The growth plan, research proposal, award certificates, music teaching plans, and seminar video materials are usually recorded by studios.

The concern from the Chinese government and schools towards music teachers' PD has led an increasing number of Chinese education companies to devote themselves to developing teaching resources for music teachers and teacher training programs. In recent years, various music education and training institutions have been established in China. Founded in 2006, Beijing Magic Flute Innovation Technology Development Co., LTD, as a partner of Beijing Normal University, developed and sold early childhood music teaching resources to more than two hundred well-known kindergartens in China. The company also offered professional training for music teachers, and there was nearly six thousand music teachers participating in the training up to now. With the popularity of Orff music in China, Professor Dana Li, the former president of Chinese Musicians Association Orff Professional Committee, founded Jin Wawa Education, offering offline training courses for primary and secondary school teachers in southwest China. Tens of thousands of music educators have participated in its teacher training projects. The need of Orff music education training also attracted experts and music education trainers from Taiwan and Hong Kong to deliver lectures in China. In order to improve market competitiveness, the latest online music teacher training project from Beijing promised that participating in its training is a great shortcut to apply adult undergraduate student programs in The Central Conservatory of Music of China.

With the continuous expanding of music teacher training market, sino-foreign cooperative music teacher PD programs have been prevalent in China. The JZ-Bachson School in Shanghai provided music teacher training programs with Jazz Theory, Modern Music History, Jazz Guitar, Jazz Piano, and Jazz Vocal Music. The JZ-Bachson School officials claimed their teaching team were all world-renowned professional musicians with affluent performance experience. Topsy Education declared that the highlight of its music PD program was that participants could obtain the Orff Teaching Certificate issued by the Orff Association of Australia. By 2018, nearly seven hundreds music teachers had passed the training and assessment. The outbreak of COVID-19 made more and more music PD programs choose to be conducted online, which also provided great convenience for sino-foreign cooperation in running music teacher training. Since 2019, Shanghai Xinli Education Technology Co., LTD has cooperated with Professor Paul Hille, chairman of the FIER International Federation of Eurhythmics Teachers, carrying out Dalcroze Methods Teachers Training Program in China.

4. Challenges the Chinese Music Teacher PD Practice Met

Although much work has been done to date, many challenges persist. Firstly, the shortage of music teachers relatively restricted teachers' PD, especially in rural areas of China. The role of music teachers was often performed by language, math or other academic subjects teachers in Chinese rural regions. "There is unreasonable curriculum structure, very scarce number of music, art, biology, chemistry, and physics courses, basically we cannot recruit rural teachers of those courses. Many of the teachers who teach now are actually not majoring in this subject, but if he or she is qualified for those courses, let him or her teach those" (Li et al., 2020). As a result, teachers "hardly have time to stop and breathe for a minute during the school day, and have no time to learn new things (Liu & Hallinger, 2017). Financial and career plan have been reported to be the crucial factor associated with the shortage of teachers in rural China (Li et al., 2020; Qian et al., 2020).

Secondly, China's top-down music PD programs were considered ineffective. The core reason was that more attention has been brought to studying theories instead of nurturing practical teaching abilities (Sun & Leung, 2014). The similar indication could be found in some empirical studies on the effectiveness of NTTP in promoting teacher's professional development (Lu et al., 2019). Although NTTP is substantial and teachers attended the PD program actively, the PD program did not work since the most content of on-site and online PD was laborious to apply to teaching practice (Loyalka et al., 2019). However, some Chinese studies, which rely more on teachers' self-report to obtain data, have concluded that NTTP was effective in improve teachers' professional level. In this aspect, Loyalka et al. (2019) stressed that high self-report satisfaction was not the original intention of teachers, but driven by the physical conditions of training sites and the way teachers were treated by NTTP providers.

Some researchers also queried the effectiveness of PLCs and TRGs in China (Guo et al., 2013; Lee et al., 2011; Song et al., 2013; Zhao, 2010; Zheng et al., 2021). Ideally, PLCs and TRGs can mean teachers would be able to reflect on their practice and become empowered as agents of change (Lei & Medwell, 2020). However, under the influence of Confucian culture which emphasizes avoiding of conflict, pursuing social harmony, and respecting for authority (Yin, 2013; Zheng et al., 2019), teachers can work together in PLCs and TRGs seemingly (Wong, 2010; Yin, 2013) while talk "the right nonsense" to maintain a harmonious atmosphere (Zheng et al., 2019) to avoid criticizing others. Research from Yu and Leung (2019) illustrated that the influence of Confucian culture went far beyond it. As Confucian culture emphasizes utilitarianism, both school leaders and parents attached greater importance to the language, math, physics, and chemistry class. As a result, the support for music PD programs was also inadequate. To some extent, it also affected the initiative of music teachers pursuing PD. A research from Song et al. (2013) portrayed that China's honor system which requires schools of different levels and educational organizations to identify and recommend prominent educators could help teachers reduce isolation by getting more support from school leaders. Although there was not enough research on the extent to which the China's honor system reduce the isolation of music teachers, it can be found that on Chinese social media, some certificates and photos of music honored teachers

are posted on the official website of the schools to openly express the advocacy from the school leaders.

Last but not least, some problems appeared with the emerging music teacher training organizations. These off-campus music PD program's common problems include: 1) training time and targeted guidance were limited; 2) front-line music teachers' development demands could not be satisfied sufficiently; 3) despite the high cost of training, it is hard to guarantee the qualification and commitment of trainers. In 2021, the Chinese government issued a document which is called by Chinese people as "double minus" (Shuang Jian) policy in short. The Chinese government hoped to increase opportunities for art practice in primary and secondary students while reduce their academic pressure and intensive academic training. Due to government intrusiveness and communal pressure to achieve targets, numerous well-known academic training institutions in China have announced layoffs or closures. Some academic training institutions turned to aesthetic education and aesthetic educators' training to struggle for survival. Optimism about the aesthetic education market in China may also spur more Chinese and international entrepreneurs to invest more in the development of teaching resources and music and arts teacher training programs.

5. Conclusion

In conclusion, there is still a long way to go for China's principals, music teacher PD program providers, policymakers in China. Although China has spent massive capital and countless time on music teacher PD programs each year, an exceedingly growing number of recent publications and empirical studies have reassessed the limited positive contribution that music teacher PD programs can make to music teacher's professional levels. The present study is not without limitations. Owing to space constraints, the music teacher PD program concerning kindergarten and college music teachers was less involved in this study. Therefore, it is necessary for future research to analyze more kindergartens and universities' music teacher PD programs. Above all, the discussion on factors restricting the effectiveness of PD programs for Chinese music teachers is a promising line of inquiry. It is also possible to expect that the high-quality music teacher PD projects applicable to the Confucian cultural background can be further proposed more in the future.

References

- Bain, A., Walker, A., & Chan, A. (2011). Self-organisation and capacity building: Sustaining the change. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 49(6), 701-719. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09578231111174839>
- Choi, T.-H. (2015). The impact of the 'Teaching English through English' policy on teachers and teaching in South Korea. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 16(3), 201-220. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2015.970727>
- Choi, T.-H., & Walker, A. D. (2018). A heuristic model for tailoring teacher development to educational reforms: Focusing on ambiguity and conflict generation. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 74,

- 72-84. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2018.04.013>
- Crockett, M. D. (2007). OP-ED: Teacher professional development as a critical resource in school reform. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 39(3), 253-263. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220270701287867>
- Fullan, M. (2009). Large-scale reform comes of age. *Journal of Educational Change*, 10(2), 101-113. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10833-009-9108-z>
- Guo, S., Guo, Y., Beckett, G., Li, Q., & Guo, L. (2013). Changes in Chinese education under globalisation and market economy: Emerging issues and debates. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 43(2), 244-264. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2012.721524>
- Hairon, S., & Dimmock, C. (2012). Singapore schools and professional learning communities: Teacher professional development and school leadership in an Asian hierarchical system. *Educational Review*, 64(4), 405-424. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131911.2011.625111>
- Hargreaves, A. (2001). Emotional geographies of teaching. *Teachers College Record*, 103(6), 1056-1080. <https://doi.org/10.1111/0161-4681.00142>
- Hargreaves, A. (2007). Sustainable professional learning communities. In L. Stoll, & K. S. Louis (Eds.), *Professional learning communities: Divergence, depth and dilemmas* (pp. 181-195). McGraw-Hill.
- Harris, A. (2010). Leading system transformation. *School Leadership and Management*, 30(3), 197-207. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13632434.2010.494080>
- Ho, W.-C. (2010). Moral education in China's music education: Development and challenges. *International Journal of Music Education*, 28(1), 71-87. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761409351351>
- Law, W.-W., & Ho, W.-C. (2009). Globalization, values education, and school music education in China. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 41(4), 501-520. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220270802372329>
- Lee, J. C.-K., Yin, H., Zhang, Z., & Jin, Y. (2011). Teacher empowerment and receptivity in curriculum reform in China. *Chinese Education & Society*, 44(4), 64-81. <https://doi.org/10.2753/CED1061-1932440404>
- Lee, M., & Kim, J. (2016). The emerging landscape of school-based professional learning communities in South Korean schools. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 36(2), 266-284. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2016.1148854>
- Lei, M., & Medwell, J. (2020). How do English language teachers understand the idea of professional development in the recent curriculum reforms in China? *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 40(3), 401-417. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2020.1717440>
- Li, J., Shi, Z., & Xue, E. (2020). The problems, needs and strategies of rural teacher development at deep poverty areas in China: Rural schooling stakeholder perspectives. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 99, Article 101496. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2019.101496>
- Lieberman, A. (2007). Professional learning communities: A reflection. In L. Stoll, & K. S. Louis (Eds.), *Professional learning communities: Divergence, depth and dilemmas* (pp. 199-203). McGraw-Hill.

- Liu, S., & Hallinger, P. (2017). Teacher development in rural China: How ineffective school leadership fails to make a difference. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 21(6), 633-650. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603124.2017.1294266>
- Loyalka, P., Popova, A., Li, G., & Shi, Z. (2019). Does teacher training actually work? Evidence from a large-scale randomized evaluation of a national teacher training program. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 11(3), 128-154. <https://doi.org/10.1257/app.20170226>
- Lu, M., Loyalka, P., Shi, Y., Chang, F., Liu, C., & Rozelle, S. (2019). The impact of teacher professional development programs on student achievement in rural China: Evidence from Shaanxi Province. *Journal of Development Effectiveness*, 11(2), 105-131. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19439342.2019.1624594>
- MOE. (2001, June 8). *Jichu Jiaoyu Kecheng Gaige Gangyao (Shixing)* [Outline of the Curriculum Reform for Basic Education (Trial)]. Retrieved from http://www.moe.gov.cn/srcsite/A26/jcj_kcjcgh/200106/t20010608_167343.html
- MOE. (2008, September 8). *Jiaoyubu Guanyu Jinyibu Jiaqiang Zhongxiaoxue Yishu Jiaoyu De Yijian* [Opinions of the Ministry of Education on further strengthening art education in primary and secondary schools]. Retrieved from http://www.moe.gov.cn/srcsite/A17/moe_794/moe_795/200809/t20080908_80591.html
- MOE. (2020, October 15). *Zhonggong Zhongyang Bangongting Guowuyuan Bangongting Yinfa "Guanyu Quanmian Jiaqiang He Gaijin Xinshidai Xuexiao Tiyu Gongzuo De Yijian" He "Guanyu Quanmian Jiaqiang He Gaijin Xinshidai Xuexiao Meiyu Gongzuo De Yijian"* [General Office of the State Council Issued "Opinions on Comprehensively Strengthening and Improving School Physical Education in the New Era" and "Opinions on Comprehensively Strengthening and Improving School Aesthetic Education in the New Era"]. Retrieved from http://www.moe.gov.cn/jyb_xxgk/moe_1777/moe_1778/202010/t20201015_494794.html
- Mourshed, M., Chijioko, C., & Barber, M. (2011). How the worlds most improved school systems keep getting better. *Educational Studies*, 1, 7-25.
- Muijs, D., & Lindsay, G. (2008). Where are we at? An empirical study of levels and methods of evaluating continuing professional development. *British Educational Research Journal*, 34(2), 195-211. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01411920701532194>
- OECD [Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development]. (2015). *Education policy outlook 2015: Making reforms happen*. Paris: OECD. <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264225442-en>
- Paik, S., Zhang, M., Lundeberg, M. A., Eberhardt, J., Shin, T. S., & Zhang, T. (2011). Supporting science teachers in alignment with state curriculum standards through professional development: Teachers' preparedness, expectations and their fulfillment. *Journal of Science Education and Technology*, 20(4), 422-434. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10956-011-9308-1>
- Paine, L., & Ma, L. (1993). Teachers working together: A dialogue on organizational and cultural perspectives of Chinese teachers. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 19(8), 675-697.

- [https://doi.org/10.1016/0883-0355\(93\)90009-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/0883-0355(93)90009-9)
- Pyhältö, K., Soini, T., & Pietarinen, J. (2011). A systemic perspective on school reform: Principals' and chief education officers' perspectives on school development. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 49(1), 46-61. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09578231111102054>
- Qian, H., Youngs, P., Hu, S., & Prawat, X. J. (2020). Will China's free teacher education policy address teacher shortages in rural schools or reproduce existing inequality? *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 50(5), 713-725. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2018.1559037>
- Reichstetter, R. (2006). *Defining a professional learning community: A literature review (E & R Research Alert)*. https://webarchive.wcpss.net/results/reports/2006/0605plc_lit_review.pdf
- Richter, D., Kunter, M., Klusmann, U., Lüdtke, O., & Baumert, J. (2011). Professional development across the teaching career: Teachers' uptake of formal and informal learning opportunities. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 27(1), 116-126. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2010.07.008>
- Ryan, J., Kang, C., Mitchell, I., & Erickson, G. (2009). China's basic education reform: An account of an international collaborative research and development project. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 29(4), 427-441. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188790903308902>
- Scott, C., & Sutton, R. E. (2009). Emotions and change during professional development for teachers: A mixed methods study. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, 3(2), 151-171. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1558689808325770>
- Song, H., Zhu, X., & Liu, L. B. (2013). The honourable road and its impact on teacher practice: An analysis of China's national honour system in cultivating professional development. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 41(3), 253-270. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1359866X.2013.809055>
- Spillane, J. P. (2012). The more things change, the more things stay the same?. *Education and Urban Society*, 44(2), 123-127. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124511431567>
- Starkey, L., Yates, A., Meyer, L. H., Hall, C., Taylor, M., Stevens, S., & Toia, R. (2009a). Professional development design: Embedding educational reform in New Zealand. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 25(1), 181-189. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2008.08.007>
- Sun, Z., & Leung, B. W. (2014). A survey of rural primary school music education in Northeastern China. *International Journal of Music Education*, 32(4), 437-461. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761413491197>
- Tan, C. (2016). Tensions and challenges in China's education policy borrowing. *Educational Research*, 58(2), 195-206. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131881.2016.1165551>
- Tao, J., & Gao, X. (2017). Teacher agency and identity commitment in curricular reform. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 63, 346-355. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.01.010>
- Tsui, A. B. M., & Wong, J. L. N. (2009). In search of a third space: Teacher development in Mainland China. In C. K. K. Chan & N. Rao (Eds.), *Revisiting the Chinese learner: Changing contexts, changing education* (pp. 281-311). Springer.

- Wang, T. (2016). School leadership and professional learning community: Case study of two senior high schools in Northeast China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 36(2), 202-216. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2016.1148849>
- Wong, J. L. (2010). Searching for good practice in teaching: A comparison of two subject-based professional learning communities in a secondary school in Shanghai. *Compare*, 40(5), 623-639. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057920903553308>
- Xie, J., & Leung, B. W. (2011). Students' motivation to study music: The mainland China context. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 33(1), 59-72. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X11404654>
- Xue, E., & Li, J. (2021). What is the ultimate education task in China? Exploring "strengthen moral education for cultivating people" ("Li De Shu Ren"). *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 53(2), 128-139. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2020.1754539>
- Yin, H. (2013). Societal culture and teachers' responses to curriculum reform: Experiences from China. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 14(3), 391-401. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-013-9266-9>
- Yu, Z., & Leung, B.-W. (2019). Music teachers and their implementation of the new music curriculum standards in China. *International Journal of Music Education*, 37(2), 178-197. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761418820647>
- Zhao, J. (2010). School knowledge management framework and strategies: The new perspective on teacher professional development. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 26(2), 168-175. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2009.10.009>
- Zheng, X., Yin, H., & Li, Z. (2019). Exploring the relationships among instructional leadership, professional learning communities and teacher self-efficacy in China. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 47(6), 843-859. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1741143218764176>
- Zheng, X., Yin, H., & Liu, Y. (2021). Are professional learning communities beneficial for teachers? A multilevel analysis of teacher self-efficacy and commitment in China. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 32(2), 197-217. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09243453.2020.1808484>
- Zheng, X., Zhang, J., & Wang, W. (2019). Teacher learning as boundary crossing: A case study of Master Teacher Studios in China. *Teachers and Teaching*, 25(7), 837-854. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2019.1673358>