

Original Paper

Subtitling for Cooperation?

A Case in São Tomé and Príncipe

M. Montroy^{1*}

¹ Universitat Jaume I, Castelló de la Plana, Spain

* M. Montroy, Universitat Jaume I, Castelló de la Plana, Spain

Received: April 17, 2020

Accepted: April 28, 2020

Online Published: May 11, 2020

doi:10.22158/sll.v4n2p75

URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.22158/sll.v4n2p75>

Abstract

This paper explores the possibilities of subtitling for Cooperation projects in São Tome island. We focus on the marginalization situation of elderly people and their language, creole Forro. To achieve this objective, three elderly Forro speakers were interviewed on linguistic and cultural matters. A group of non-older people watched the video of these interviews subtitled in Portuguese to analyse their opinions on the same issues and their perception of subtitling. Finally, different agents related to Cooperation and Audiovisual Translation were consulted on the possibilities of subtitling applied to Cooperation in São Tome.

Keywords

audiovisual translation, subtitling, São Tome, language revitalisation, cooperation

1. Introduction

São Tome and Príncipe is located in the Gulf of Guinea, near the line of the equator. It has an area of 1001 km and a population of 194000 inhabitants (AFDB, 2016). In terms of human development, it ranks 127th in a list of 175 countries (Gonçalves de Género, 2012). The languages spoken in this country are: Portuguese, Lunguye (in the island of Príncipe), Cape-Verdian creole, Angolar and Forro, also known as Santome or Dialecto, the most widespread and thus considered the national creole (Hagemeijer, 2009).

Since São Tome and Príncipe gained independence from Portugal in 1975, Portuguese has been consolidated as the exclusive language (Gonçalves & Hagemeijer, 2015) and, although the national Constitution does not contemplate its linguistic reality (Gouveia, 1993), in practice Portuguese is used as the only official language. The stigmatization of creoles in the colonial period has not been overcome and has even led to a decrease in some elements of cultural or religious identity, and to the

risk of disappearance of creole Forro (Ribeiro de Souza, 2015). Currently, people who use Forro on a daily basis are those who live in the most rural areas and, above all, the elderly (Mata, 2004; Ribeiro de Souza, 2015).

At present, the vehicular language of education is Portuguese and creoles are not included in the education system (Hagemeyer, Gonçalves, & Afonso, 2018). National newspapers generally publish in Portuguese and it is in the audiovisual media where a greater presence of creole languages can be found, for example in the broadcast of music videos (Antunes, personal communication, 2016). All TV channels are in Portuguese except for some specific programming in Forro, while the radio broadcasts songs both in Portuguese and in creole languages (Hagemeyer, Gonçalves, & Afonso, 2018; Bouchard, 2017). As for the external material that is broadcasted on the national television channel (TVS), it usually comes from Brazil, either Brazilian programming or foreign material dubbed in Brazilian Portuguese (Malé, personal communication, 2019).

On the social situation of elderly people, it is important to note that many peculiarities of an advanced age as insomnia, are related to sorcery by some people (Valverde, 2000; Espírito Santo, 2009; Neves, 2009). These prejudgements lead to marginalization and physical and psychological abuse of the elderly. In addition, a 2002 PNUD report points to the exclusion of older people as one of the consequences of poverty in families (PNUD, 2002). At the same time, the exclusion of the elderly is also noted as the cause of their high poverty rate: they tend to be the last to receive any kind of resource such as food, drinking water, basic healthcare and social protection (Cooperación Bierzo Sur, 2012-2013).

These characteristics of São Tome and Príncipe motivate this contribution to assess the possibility of using subtitling as an active tool for Cooperation in São Tome framed in a project that allows the inclusion of elderly people through the revitalisation of Forro.

It should be noted that the intention of this work is not to suggest that subtitling is the only method to revitalise Forro and improve the situation of elderly people, nor that it can fulfil these functions without the support of other disciplines. Our intention is to focus on the applicability and impact that the use of audiovisual translated material in the context of Forro and the elderly can have in combination with other initiatives from organizations or institutions that strive for this same objective. In other words, subtitling is proposed as an additional tool to row in the same direction.

2. Method

First of all, interviews conducted with three elders of São Tome in Forro about their perception on their social situation, Forro language and some traditions of the country were recorded. From excerpts of these interviews, a 12-minute video was created to be shown to non-elderly interviewees.

Secondly, this video was subtitled in Portuguese, without taking into consideration the usual conventions to ensure the correct reading and understanding of subtitles. These adaptations are further explained in section 2.2.

Thirdly, 16 people of different age, sex and profession residing in São Tome were interviewed. In a first phase, they answered questions about their perception of the country's culture, language and elders' situation. They were then shown the video and, in a second phase, they reflect on the issues the elderly talk about in the video.

Finally, experts in Linguistic Cooperation, International Cooperation and Audiovisual Translation were invited to participate in focus groups about the results of the interviews conducted in São Tome to analyse their reaction in relation to subtitling in the context of this work.

2.1 São Tome Participants

This part of the research includes 19 participants from São Tome: three elderly and 16 people aged between 18 and 50. Their responses and comments were collected in audio and/or video and also by field notes.

For the interviews with the elders, three phases were attempted: one in which they were asked about their life in the past (what their life was like, which language was more widely spoken, etc.), another in which they were asked about current cultural features of São Tome (songs, traditions, etc.), and the last one, in which they reflect about the state of their language, their traditions and their life as elderly people.

For non-elderly people, a semi-structured interview model was raised in which, the interviewees had a set of fixed questions and, depending on their characteristics, background or answers, some questions could be added or amended. The most significant sentences from these interviews were grouped into four different matters: language and old people, language and education, language and feelings, subtitling. These matters would later serve as a basis for the focus groups.

2.2 Adaptation of Subtitling Conventions

The reality of São Tome and Príncipe differs from Europe's due to deficiencies in education (Cardoso, 2004; Instituto Nacional de Estatística, 2018; MECCC, 2016; Ministério da Educação, Cultura e Formação, 2012), which undoubtedly determines the reading speed and comprehension. Consequently, usual conventions of subtitling have to be adapted to the specific needs of this country.

In order to achieve this, we had the help of one of the interviewees whose nickname in this research is Alda (36 years old), a domestic worker with basic studies and without reading habits. Her knowledge of Forro is passive: she understands it without difficulties, but admits she has not spoken it until that moment, when she starts using it to speak with elderly people.

Once the video of the elderly was edited, it was subtitled in Alda's presence, who expressed the difficulties she encountered. These difficulties could be summarized in lack of time to read and understand subtitles. Therefore, information was summarized as much as possible and on-screen time

of subtitles was also extended according to Alda's observations until she confirmed that she could read them comfortably. As a result, subtitles are irregular, as both their length and the time on screen depend on the speed and difficulty of each speech. However, no interviewee experienced any difficulty reading the subtitles, which was the intention of this adaptation.

The comparative tables below show the general conventions proposed by Díaz-Cintas (2012) and the adaptations performed. For each convention, it is explained what change was, if any, and "unchanged" if the original convention has been maintained. Some were not applicable due to the content of the video.

Table 1 (spatial conventions) shows differences in characters per line: while the general conventions indicate between 28 and 49 characters, the adaptation for São Tome is between 7 and 39.

Table 1. Adaptation of Spatial Conventions

Spatial conventions (Díaz-Cintas, 2012)	Spatial conventions in São Tome
Subtitles at the bottom of the screen	No modifications
Maximum two lines	No modifications
One line for each character speaking in the same subtitle	Not applicable
28-49 characters per line	7-39 characters per line

Table 2 shows temporal conventions. We can see cps are between 10 and 14 in Díaz-Cintas (2012) proposal but between 3 and 13 in the adaptation. Subtitles are kept on screen longer according to the length or difficulty of the speech, even if the dialogue has finished. Orthotypographical conventions (Table 3) remain the same.

Table 2. Adaptation of Temporal Conventions

Temporal conventions (Díaz-Cintas, 2012)	Temporal conventions in São Tome
Subtitles are synchronized with dialogues	Subtitles stay longer on the screen, even if the intervention has finished
Subtitles between 10-14 cps	Subtitles between 3-14 cps

Table 3. Adaptation of Orthotypographical Conventions

Orthotypographical conventions (Díaz-Cintas, 2012)	Orthotypographical conventions in São Tome
Dot (.) when a subtitle ends	No modifications
Punctuation marks are not removed	No modifications
Ellipsis for pauses, omissions and interruptions	No modifications
A hyphen at the beginning of the second line indicates that two characters speak in the same subtitle	Not applicable
Capital letters for the title and uppercase texts that appear in the video	Not applicable
Quotation marks (“”) are used to indicate quotations and the value of certain expressions	Not applicable

In Table 4 we can see linguistic conventions. The most remarkable aspect in this case is the amount of information that is dispensed with to facilitate reading. One example is when one of the elder explains in detail one of the traditions of the country. In her speech, she explains who participates in this celebration, how the table is prepared, what is the food they share, the song they sing, etc. However, subtitles do not show all the foods she is talking about, or the lyrics of the song, among other details. This reduction was necessary to respect the reading speech of those who would watch the video later, and only the most relevant information was maintained.

Table 4. Adaptation of Linguistic Conventions

Linguistic conventions (Díaz-Cintas, 2012)	Linguistic conventions in São Tome
Abbreviations and symbols	Not applicable
Numbers from 1 to 9 in letters. From 10 on with digits	Not applicable
Respect grammatical units	No modifications
Information in the oral text must be summarized	The content is considerably more summarized than in general conventions so that subtitles can be kept longer on screen.
Idiomatic nuances and cultural references must be respected	No modifications
Texts appearing in the video must be subtitled	Not applicable
Subtitles do not contradict images	No modifications
Subtitles are synchronized with images	No modifications

2.3 Experts

The experts consulted were chosen for their experience in International Cooperation, Audiovisual Translation and Linguistic Cooperation, as those are the fundamental pillars of this work. To gather their opinions, two focus groups were held, one with experts in International Cooperation and another with experts in Audiovisual Translation, plus an interview with two members of the NGO Garabide, which specifically works in Linguistic Cooperation.

Once the social and linguistic situation of São Tome was exposed, the focus group of experts in Cooperation was based on an exchange of views on the possible use of subtitling in a cooperation project in São Tome with the aim to promote Forro language while working for the visibility and awareness of the elderly. These experts also value the following quotes 1 to 10, being 1 the lowest value and 10 the highest:

- 1) Linguistic Cooperation should be taken more into account in International Cooperation.
- 2) Linguistic Cooperation is useful in some of the countries where I have worked.
- 3) Linguistic Cooperation is useful in the particular context of the elderly in São Tome.
- 4) Subtitling is a useful tool in Cooperation.
- 5) Subtitling is useful in Linguistic Cooperation projects.

The focus group of audiovisual translators discusses alternative applications of Audiovisual Translation and its possibilities in São Tome. Translators were also asked to score some items:

- 1) Audiovisual Translation is useful in language revitalisation projects.
- 2) Audiovisual Translation is useful in International Cooperation projects.

- 3) Subtitling is useful in the particular context of São Tome.
- 4) Please value the usefulness of subtitling or SDH (subtitling for deaf and hard-of-hearing) compared to other modalities that replace the original dialogue band (as dubbing) in a context of language revitalisation.
- 5) Please value the usefulness of subtitling or SDH (subtitling for deaf and hard-of-hearing) compared to other modalities that replace the original dialogue band (as dubbing) in a context of International Cooperation.

The purpose of the interview with the two experts in Linguistic Cooperation was to discover their opinion on the effects of subtitling videos about cultural and ethnological topics related to the elders of São Tome in Forro, and whether subtitling could be useful to develop integration projects or language revitalisation programs. As in the previous focus groups, these experts also valued from 1 to 10 a set of phrases related to the usefulness of subtitling for Linguistic Cooperation:

- 1) Subtitling is a useful tool in Linguistic Cooperation projects.
- 2) Subtitling is a useful tool in linguistic projects of International Cooperation.
- 3) Subtitling is useful in raising awareness of the elderly and revitalising Forro language in the particular context of São Tome.

3. Results

This section presents the results of the interviews conducted in São Tome, first with the three elder participants and also with non-elderly people, and the results obtained from the focus groups and interviews with experts, whose contributions complement this study, as it is presented below.

3.1. São Tome Participants: Elderly People

During the interviews with the elderly we found that Forro is a language linked to the family environment, although they also believe that Portuguese is the most appropriate language to address children. They are part of a generation that raised their children in Portuguese and, for them, Forro must be spoken once they become adults.

According to these elders, there are songs that are no longer known and traditional dances are performed in another way and with other intentionality: many traditional instruments are not used any more and the intentionality is participating in competitions, not dancing for fun, as it was done in the past. The elderly also perceive a widespread loss of interest in the country's traditions and think they will disappear.

Regarding the treatment of the elderly, they think that families no longer care about visiting their grandparents and state that the situation was very different when they were young. They explain that the neighbours took great care of the elderly, sent the children to bring them food, and had great respect for them. However, they are now accused of sorcery and even abused.

3.2. São Tome Participants: Non-Elderly People

It must be noted that in order to facilitate the analysis of their responses in the sociocultural context of São Tome, they are divided by age: under 20 years old, between 20 and 30, between 30 and 40 and between 40 and 50 years old. However, in this case, their responses are organised according to the most remarkable issues that arose during the interviews.

- Perception of Forro: in the group of interviewees under 20, one participant claimed that Forro is his mother tongue, two of them can only understand it, and one of them cannot understand nor speak this language (pseudonym Elmer). All of them would like Forro to be taught at schools and more TV content in this language. It is precisely Elmer, who does not speak nor understand Forro, who justifies this opinion because he believes that the presence of Forro in the media would help young people to learn it.

In the group of people aged between 20 and 30 years old, Forro is considered the language to address old people, as it is a strange language for the youth and they are not interested in it. All of them would like that there were more presence of Forro in the media and also that this language could be taught at schools. One of them says that, if this does not happen, Forro language will disappear. However, another interviewee points out that Forro teaching should be entertaining and not like any other subject.

When asked why parents no longer speak in Forro with their children, one of them says they do speak Forro with children, but just to make jokes. They think children probably understand it, but are unable to speak it. An interviewee explains that some parents speak Forro to their children, but she would like that more parents followed this initiative. However, all of them speak Portuguese to their kids. One of them justifies this by saying that his daughter is too young to speak in this language and Portuguese will be more useful for her in her daily life. Another participant thinks that more people would learn Forro if its learning were facilitated.

There are only two interviewees aged between 30 and 40. Both of them think that Forro is a language to address elderly people. One of them says that she speaks to her sons in Portuguese because it is the most correct language for children. However, both of them would like Forro to be taught at schools. They believe that the language would be learned better at school than at home. They say that Forro was more widely spoken in the past, but now it is considered an old people's language.

In the group of interviewees aged between 40 and 50, one of the participants believes that health care workers should be able to speak Forro to better serve elderly people. Another interviewee says that Forro is only used to make jokes or to say proverbs.

When asked why parents no longer speak in Forro with their children, each one of them gives a different reason: because it is difficult to speak well given that no one uses it and, when used, it is mixed with Portuguese; because they consider it is a difficult language for children; because adults have no interest in this language and, therefore, children learn this disinterest; and because the language is not studied at school.

One of the interviewees in this group explains that she proposed that Forro were taught at her children's school. She was told that that had been already tried and the project failed, but she believes it was because it was taught as one more subject and, in her opinion, Forro should be taught with a playful and entertaining methodology.

According to this same interviewee, parents no longer speak Forro with their children because this language is not included in the school curriculum and there is still a bit of prejudice that Portuguese is the most cultured language. Still, she says there are also people committed to maintaining the language, and if Forro was included in school, many parents would surely like their children to learn it.

- Discrimination against the elderly: two of the interviewees under 20 agree that impoverished elderly people are the most discriminated. Another interviewee of this group says that most families leave their grandparents and that even institutions do not give them the support they need. They explain that they are abused and sometimes even children insult them. One of the interviewees believes that many elderly avoid talking to young people for fear of rejection.

In the group between 20 and 30, one of the interviewees recognises that she had never thought about how the elders' life is. The rest of them are aware that they live with many difficulties. Two interviewees emphasise that the elderly who are more discriminated are the poorest. One of the interviewees, however, is very annoyed with this matter, as he thinks that today's elders have not been able to behave nor educate their children correctly when they were younger and that is why there are scenes of discrimination and abandonment nowadays.

In general, the interviewees of this age group agree that older people were more respected in the past than they are now and that this harms society as a whole because their ancestral knowledge will be lost.

Interviewees aged between 30 and 40 acknowledge that elderly's life is complicated and some of them are accused of sorcery, especially when they are impoverished, as one of them indicates. The same interviewee comments that discrimination against the elderly is always associated not only with the economic level, but also with gender. According to her, there are more men who are considered healers (positive

connotation) than women, who are more commonly accused of sorcery (negative connotation). The other interviewee reflects on how her own children will behave when she becomes old. She believes that, despite all the attentions and education she provides them, they will also leave her aside.

Interviewees between 40 and 50 agree that elderly people's life is very precarious. One of them believes that the abandonment of the elderly is due to the fact that families don't have time to take care of their grandparents and the old role they had in caring their grandchildren has been lost. This role meant that children saw spending time with the elderly as something natural and they could also see how parents took care of them. Therefore, they behaved the same when they became adults. An interviewee thinks that the elderly are taken apart when they could still contribute something to society, such as teaching a few hours of some class.

- Perception of subtitling: after watching the video of the elderly with subtitles, interviewees under 20 stated they would like to watch more programs in Forro with subtitles on TV. Two of them add that it would be useful to learn the language.

In the group between 20 and 30 years old everyone likes the experience of watching a video in Forro with subtitles in Portuguese and would be willing to watch subtitled programs. One of them considers important that the TV broadcasted in this format to facilitate the learning of Forro. Another believes that, if this was done, they could learn more about their own culture.

Interviewees between 30 and 40 think that if there was more programming in Forro with subtitles, it would be easier to learn the language. One of the interviewees proposes the inclusion of a children's TV programme in Forro with subtitles so that they can start to learn the language.

Interviewees between 40 and 50 would be willing to watch more programs in Forro with subtitles. One of them thinks that it is a good idea because no one would feel excluded.

3.3 Experts in International Cooperation

In the first focus group, with experts in Cooperation, some contradictions arise: they agree on the need to adapt to the language of the country in which projects are to be developed in order to respect the beneficiaries of such projects, and on preventing language extinction, as it would be a cultural impoverishment of all humanity. However, when it comes to revitalizing minority languages, the opinion of some of them varies, and it arises that it would entail a large investment and also that it could disintegrate nations by encouraging independence movements.

On the proposal to integrate linguistic revitalization into cooperation projects, there are different reactions: those who are against think that this is not cooperation, but politics and it concerns to governments.

When asked whether it would be possible to integrate language revitalization into cooperation in the case of São Tome, all experts think that it would be possible and would give the elderly a status of exclusivity, which would improve their social status. One of the interviewees proposes the implementation of a poetry contest, or a compilation of sayings and stories that the elderly could tell to children. Audiovisual Translation could be integrated in these proposals and thus, the possibility of recording videos with this content in Forro with subtitles could be studied.

About the role of subtitling in this context, two different opinions arise. Some of the interviewees think it is a good tool in the particular case of São Tome. Nevertheless, other interviewees think it would not be useful because of the number of illiterate people in the country. In this regard, it should be noted that the National Institute of Statistics of São Tome and Príncipe indicates a literacy level of 90, 1 per cent (Instituto Nacional de Estatística, 2018). According to the president of Cooperation Bierzo Sur, NGO with 10 years of experience in São Tome and Príncipe, during a personal communication, despite the country's administration efforts to facilitate for mothers the registration of their newborn children, there are still many families who do not register their children (Álvarez, personal communication, 2019). According to this information, official data must be taken with some relativity and, consequently, it is very possible that the literacy level is not as high as the official data suggest. It is also true, however, that efforts have been made in recent years to improve the educational system in the country, as indicated in a report by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Science and Education (MECCC, 2016). So while real literacy data may not be as optimistic as the official report states, it is likely that neither is it as pessimistic as some experts in this group think.

As a conclusion of the session, these experts valued the following items with a score from 1 to 10, being 1 the lowest value and 10 the highest:

- Linguistic Cooperation should be taken more into account in International Cooperation. Scored 8, 6, 5, 10, 9 i 10.
- Linguistic Cooperation is useful in some of the countries where I have worked. Scored 4, 6, 2, 10, 10 i 8.
- Linguistic Cooperation is useful in the particular context of the elderly in São Tome. Scored 7, 8, 5, 10, 10 i 10.
- Subtitling is a useful tool in Cooperation. Scored 8, 6, 5, 6, 9 i 10.
- Subtitling is useful in Linguistic Cooperation projects. Scored 7, 6, 5, 8, 9 i 10.

As noted from their scores, all experts in International Cooperation consider to a greater or lesser extent that Linguistic Cooperation should be taken more into account. There is more variety on their

consideration of whether linguistic cooperation would be useful in any of the countries where the experts have worked, with values of between 4 and 10.

In relation to the previous consideration, all experts positively rate Linguistic Cooperation in the particular case of the elderly in São Tome. The use of subtitling as a tool for cooperation and language revitalization projects is also appreciated.

3.4 Experts in Linguistic Cooperation

These experts agree that it is often considered worldwide that languages spoken by the elderly have nothing to contribute to the new generations, as they are languages with no presence in administrations or schools, they are not prepared for technological challenges and are not useful to find a job.

For them, subtitling could be a useful tool in Linguistic Cooperation projects as it would help to learn and dignify Forro, although one of them thinks that it would be more appropriate if subtitles were in Forro, as he believes that if subtitles are in Portuguese, Forro would not be necessary to understand the video. He suggests to subtitle foreign material that might be interesting for the population in Forro. The other expert, appreciates the fact that subtitling is an economic tool to develop in Cooperation.

On who would subtitle the videos, both experts think that local people, specialized translators, volunteer translators or a combination of all these options could be involved. However, they warn that, for good results, subtitling should not be the only technique used to revitalize Forro. In their experience, good results are obtained when working with different people or organizations with a common interest and, in this sense, it is essential to create a network between different fields of work that are willing to collaborate to revitalise Forro using different techniques. In addition, one of these experts points out that the country's administration should participate in some way. His second advice is to conduct a previous study on what would be the most appropriate content of the videos and how often it will be exposed to the public.

Regarding distribution, these experts believe that it would be very effective to involve television and schools, although it is also possible to involve associations and use the internet and social networks as dissemination tools. First of all, it is necessary to decide how the video will be: humorous, cultural, educational, musical, for children, etc.; then study how often it could be broadcasted. This would depend on the form of broadcasting since, if television is used, a schedule and days of broadcasting should be negotiated, the program should be publicized, etc. If it is posed as a travelling projection at schools, it should be studied the range of ages it should be addressed to, the frequency of screening, negotiating with teachers and the Ministry of Education to have their collaboration as it might be projected during teaching hours, ensure transport to carry the projection to schools, etc. If the project is raised as a travelling cinema, agreements on the projection schedule and transport should also be reached in order to bring the cinema to the areas of the country that have been agreed.

One of the experts emphasizes the importance of recording elders and all their knowledge to use this material with younger generations. The other expert emphasizes the importance of including Forro in

the educational system, not as the other subjects, but with a new playful approach that includes the stories of the elderly and activities that could be developed from these stories.

Finally, these experts score the usefulness of Audiovisual Translation from 1 to 10 in the following cases:

- Audiovisual Translation is useful in linguistic revitalization projects. Scored 7 and 6.
- Subtitling is useful in linguistic projects of International Cooperation. Scored 6 and 5, 5.
- Subtitling is useful in raising awareness about elderly people and revitalizing Forro language in the particular context of São Tome and Príncipe. Scored 9 and 6, 5.

Although all scores are positive, they are not as high as other experts' scores. The reason is that, as they indicate during the meeting, subtitling cannot be the only tool of language revitalisation and/or International Cooperation, as it is a discipline that should work together with other disciplines and entities (precisely *cooperating*) framed in a sufficiently studied and solid plan to obtain satisfactory results. Bearing this in mind and how the questions they had to value were formulated, it is natural that their punctuations are not too high.

3.5 Experts in Audiovisual Translation

This group of experts notes the usefulness of subtitling as a tool for literacy. This option is very interesting if it is linked to the observation emerged in the group of experts in International Cooperation on illiteracy in São Tome and Príncipe, because it offers working options aimed at people who cannot read or write. This variant would require its own research and a more detailed literacy census to establish an appropriate work plan.

These experts believe that subtitling can bring the situation of the elderly and Forro closer to the population because, in their words, when certain issues are integrated into television, people no longer find them so far from them and therefore, in the case of São Tome, the rejection of the language and the elder would be reduced. In this particular, experts also believe that children are key in language revitalisation and, in this sense, subtitling would play an important role by facilitating the understanding of Forro language.

One of these experts proposes dubbing in Forro interesting material for the public and subtitling it in Portuguese. This expert suggests the elder as voice-over actors. This proposal is very interesting from the point of view of Cooperation although it would be necessary to study the economic and sustainability possibilities that this idea would have.

Another expert from this group has the idea of a program in which elderly from different parts of the country are visited and asked to explain in Forro the cultural characteristics of that area (gastronomy, music, etc.).

The idea of a travelling cinema also arises and everyone agrees that the best option would be to combine national and foreign content. In this case, one of the experts proposes that, before the film begins, a short film or government campaign could be screened raising awareness of the situation of the

elderly. They also propose the projection of an introductory video to Forro language with basic concepts. There is no doubt that it would be necessary to study the possibilities of all these suggestions to check their viability, but all of them are valuable contributions that offer new perspectives for Audiovisual Translation as a tool for Cooperation.

For one of these experts, subtitling will be useful when there is already an existing basis of language revitalization, not before. This assessment is very important, since the approach of this work implies a proposal for the use of Audiovisual Translation as a tool for Cooperation, but not as a key solution.

In general, all the items suggested were rated at a very high score by these experts, although the score difference is striking in two cases:

1) The usefulness of subtitling or SDH in relation to other modalities such as dubbing in a context of linguistic revitalization is scored 8, 5, 5 and 8. In other words, for half of the experts, other modalities of Audiovisual Translation such as dubbing have the same possibilities as subtitling in linguistic revitalization projects. This option had not been contemplated at the beginning of the investigation because of the economic advantages that are presumed to subtitling with respect to dubbing, but it seems that the perception of these experts is that it would be an equally viable option, which opens the doors to future research in this field.

2) The usefulness of subtitling or SDH in other modalities such as dubbing in an International Cooperation context was scored with 6, 5, 7 and 8. In this case, it seems that experts do find subtitling more useful than other modalities, although they also find possibilities for dubbing in this field as evidenced by their interventions. Again, these considerations offer new possibilities of research to see what would be the real viability of the different modalities of Audiovisual Translation in International Cooperation projects.

4. Conclusions and Future Lines of Research

The opinions of all participants and experts are of an utmost importance for this research, as they offer a complete view of the possibilities of subtitling for Cooperation in favour of the elderly and Forro language in São Tome. The most remarkable conclusions and some proposals for future research lines are presented below.

Starting with participants from São Tome, they stated they would like that Forro was taught at schools. However, they all agree that methodology should be different, fun and entertaining. As they also explain that Forro is used to sing and joke, we can assume that the introduction of songs, jokes and stories would be a good start for Forro in the educational field, and in these activities it is not difficult to imagine the prominence that old people could have. At the same time, different interviewees point out the usefulness of subtitling for learning Forro and all of them stated that they would like to see more programmes in Forro with subtitles. In the light of these considerations, it makes sense to raise exposure to subtitled videos of elders that might serve to encourage the learning of Forro through songs

or stories that could be shown either in schools with governmental collaboration or through a travelling cinema.

As for the experts consulted, some of the issues arisen are worthy of attention. For example, the belief among some experts in International Cooperation that language revitalization will lead to nations disintegration. We understand that political conflicts that may arise from linguistic revitalization come from an already existing conflict situation and that language development would not be the cause of a political conflict, but an added element. However, no political or social situations that may be aggravated by the revitalization of the Forro language are currently identified in São Tome and therefore this problem would not apply.

In this same group, some experts think that language revitalisation is not cooperation, but politics. Doubts arise from this statement about where the dividing line of what belongs to cooperation and what belongs to Governments is. In principle, aspects such as health care, infrastructure, food security, etc., are under Governments' responsibility yet there is no debate about the eligibility of International Cooperation working in these areas. It is therefore worth to think about why linguistic revitalization is undervalued if it can help to improve some people's life.

When it comes to score the usefulness of Linguistic Cooperation in the countries where they have worked, a great difference of scores can be appreciated (v.2.3). We understand that this difference is due to the difficulty that some of them believe Linguistic Cooperation would have in countries where many languages are spoken. It is therefore possible that the degree of usefulness of Linguistic Cooperation is different depending on the country. However, there is a general agreement in the usefulness of subtitling in the case of São Tome.

One of the experts in Linguistic Cooperation was afraid of the possibility that, if subtitles are in Portuguese, Forro will become useless. However, as Diaz-Cintas (2012), Lertola (2012) and Talaván (2011, 2013) among other researchers indicate, watching videos in Forro with subtitles in Portuguese (standard interlinguistic subtitles) would also contribute to Forro learning. Nevertheless, this expert's approach deserves to be analysed to find out the possibilities and impact of the modality he suggests.

Another concern of these experts is that subtitling only cannot improve a linguistic or social situation: to be effective, collaboration with other organizations and techniques is needed. It should be emphasized that the intention of this work is not to present subtitling as the only tool to work for Forro language and the elders of São Tome, but to show that it can be one more useful tool in collaboration with other initiatives.

The review of the results and conclusions of this research, as well as the opinion of some of the experts, inevitably leads to the development of possible future lines of research on the inclusion of Audiovisual Translation in International Cooperation projects in São Tome.

First, a quantitative analysis would be needed in each district of the country that reveals information on how many elders are excluded or at risk of exclusion and how the neighbourhood perceives them to

have a clear idea of the most affected areas and where would be necessary to prioritize works. Having this information, clear guidelines could be planned to develop awareness-raising activities as it is proposed in this article or in any other project with the same objective. It would also be possible to determine what language these elders speak in order to assess whether activities are actually carried out through the revitalization of Forro or whether it is appropriate to include other Creole languages.

With regard to illiteracy in São Tome and Príncipe compared to official data, it would be interesting to conduct an independent study to find out what the current degree of literacy is in detail. If appropriate, a research could also be conducted on the use of Audiovisual Translation to improve literacy and how it could be applied to the reality of São Tome and Príncipe.

On the idea of organising poetry contests, songs, storytelling, etc., in Forro with the elderly as protagonists suggested by the experts in International Cooperation, it must be well designed and the elders' role should be decided: the judges who decide the winner, participants, etc. It is certainly a good opportunity to start working to regain the role of telling stories that the elderly had in their families in the past, as explained by one of the interviewees from São Tome. This idea, once fully outlined, could be developed in a particular area and ideally televised with subtitles to make it known to the rest of the population. Results should be carefully analysed in order to assess the possibilities of extrapolating it to other districts.

Another idea, in this case emerged from the group of experts in Audiovisual Translation, is a travelling cinema. In order to develop this option, an agreement should be reached with the relevant Ministry to allow the projection and to agree on how the transport and itinerary of the activity would be organized. In addition, it should be specified whether projections are of dubbed and/or subtitled foreign material or national material. It should be considered how to implement awareness-raising for the elderly: an advertisement, a short film before the main projection, within the main projection, etc. In any case, it would be necessary to establish which modality of Audiovisual Translation would be the most suitable and which language would be used for subtitling or dubbing.

Generally, the experts consulted used to think of television in the means of disseminating subtitled material. In this sense, it is necessary to investigate the real impact of television in the country and what influence has on the population, to study the possibilities of negotiating with the country's television the broadcast of a children's program subtitled or dubbed in Forro and/or a program of cultural content where the elderly are the protagonists as proposed by the experts in Audiovisual Translation.

The need to involve schools in the revitalisation of Forro is noted by the experts and most participants from São Tome. They agree that this involvement should not imply to teach Forro as any other subject, but with a different and fun methodology. In this case, it would be useful to have the collaboration of pedagogues and experts in minority languages teaching, multilingualism, etc., and, above all, teachers and experts in Forro from São Tome who are interested in introducing this language at school. With all these contributions plus the support of the Ministry of Education, a specific methodology, agenda and

teaching materials should be developed. Once this agreement has been reached and implemented at some school on an experimental basis, it would be appropriate to monitor its development and reception in order to improve any disadvantages that may arise. Furthermore, this report would enable to refine this teaching plan that would be unique and could be a reference for other countries in similar situations.

As already mentioned, many aspects have yet to be investigated in the field of translation. First of all, what are the possibilities that subtitles in Forro would have, as suggested by one of the experts in Linguistic Cooperation. Secondly, the possibilities of dubbing in the case of São Tome and Príncipe through dubbing workshops with elderly people as proposed by the experts in Audiovisual Translation. It could even be appreciated that children and young people were also involved as an intergenerational project.

Still, many aspects of Audiovisual Translation would remain to be investigated in such a scenario, for example, SDH as a tool for integrating deaf people. Another activity to be analysed, in case that Audiovisual Translation is well received and a positive progress is registered, would be the organization of training courses in dubbing and subtitling so that these activities can be delegated to local people allowing them to have the autonomy to continue with these initiatives without depending on external organizations.

In addition, it would be desirable to establish subtitling conventions for São Tome and Príncipe if this modality is finally used. Conventions should follow unique criteria based on the speed of reading and reading comprehension of the population, for which a specific research is required.

Finally, it would be interesting to learn about other researches on the application of Audiovisual Translation in International Cooperation projects and/or language revitalization in other countries and contexts.

As we have seen, Audiovisual Translation can be used to work on different social aspects in a transversal way and adapted to the technological age in which we live. The data, opinions and testimonies collected in this research encourage this positive vision on the possibilities of Audiovisual Translation for Cooperation and Development and reinforces the personal conviction that any field of knowledge can contribute to improve some aspect of society.

References

- AFDB. (2016). *São Tomé and Príncipe*. Retrieved December, 2016, from <https://www.afdb.org/en/countries/southern-africa/São-tome-and-Príncipe>
- Cardoso, M. M. (2004). Educação/Formação/Investigação em São Tomé e Príncipe—Será uma aposta do país no caminho para o desenvolvimento?. *A questão social no novo milénio*. VIII Congresso Luso-Afro-Brasileiro de Ciências Sociais. Coimbra.
- Cooperación Bierzo Sur. (2012-2013). *Programa de evaluación geriátrica integral con ancianos de las*

- casas sociais de Cruz Vermelha em Santo Tomé y Príncipe.*
- Díaz-Cintas, J. (2012). Los subtítulos y la subtitulación en la clase de lengua extranjera. *Abehache, Revista da Associação Brasileira de Hispanistas*, 2(3), 95-114.
- Espírito Santo, A. (2009). *São Tomé e Príncipe: problemas e perspectivas para o seu desenvolvimento*. Edições Colibri.
- Gonçalves de Género, E. (2012). *Análise da Estratégia de Desenvolvimento da União Africana: Uma abordagem geo-social aplicada a São Tomé e Príncipe*. Universidade Técnica de Lisboa. Instituto Superior de Ciências Políticas e Sociais.
- Gonçalves, R., & Hagemeyer, T. (2015). O português num contexto multilingue: O caso de São Tomé e Príncipe. *Revista Científica da Universidade Eduardo Mondlane: Série Letras e Ciências Sociais*, 1(1), 87-107.
- Gouveia, J. (1993). Constituição da República Democrática de S. Tomé e Príncipe. *As constituições dos estados lusófonos* (Editorial Notícias, pp. 283-319).
- Hagemeyer, T. (2009). As Línguas de S. Tomé e Príncipe. *Revista de Crioulos de Base Lexical Portuguesa e Espanhola*, 1(1), 1-27.
- Hagemeyer, T., Gonçalves, R., & Afonso, B. (2018). Línguas e Políticas Lingüísticas em São Tomé e Príncipe. In P. Feytor Pinto, & S. Melo-Pfeiffer (Eds.), *Línguas e políticas lingüísticas em português* (pp. 54-81). Lisbon: LIDEL.
- Instituto Nacional de Estatística. (2018). *Instituto Nacional de Estatística República Democrática de São Tomé e Príncipe*. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://www.ine.st/>
- Lertola, J. (2012). The effect of the subtitling task on vocabulary learning. In A. Pym, & D. Orrego-Carmona (Eds.), *Translation Research Project 4* (pp. 61-70). Tarragona: Intercultural Studies Group, Universitat Rovira i Virgili.
- Mata, I. (2004). A voz e vez de a língua entrar na festa da independência. In F. Mão de Ferro (Ed.), *A suave pátria: reflexões político-culturais sobre a sociedade São-Tomense* (pp. 44-45). Edições Colibri.
- MECCC. (2016). *Boletim Estatístico 2015/2016. Ministério de Educação, Cultura, Ciência e Comunicação. República Democrática de São Tomé e Príncipe.*
- Ministério da Educação, Cultura e Formação. (2012). *Carta de Política Educativa São Tomé e Príncipe (Visão 2022)*. Primeira versão Maio 2012.
- Neves, P. (2009). *Estórias de Vida*. UNEAS (União Nacional dos Escritores e Artistas de S.Tomé e Príncipe).
- PNUD. (2002). *Relatório do Desenvolvimento Humano em São Tomé e Príncipe. As mudanças de 1990 a 2002 e o desenvolvimento humano.*
- Ribeiro de Souza, L. (2015). São Tomé e Príncipe em dois momentos identitários. *Cadernos de Pós-Graduação em Letras*, 5(1).

- Talaván, N. (2011). Justificación teórico-práctica del uso de los subtítulos en la enseñanza-aprendizaje de idiomas. *Trans. Revista de traductología*, 16, 23-38.
- Talaván, N. (2011). La influencia efectiva de los subtítulos en el aprendizaje de lenguas extranjeras: Análisis de investigaciones previas. *Sendebarr*, 22, 265-282.
<https://doi.org/10.24310/TRANS.2012.v0i16.3209>
- Talaván, N. (2013). *La subtitulación en el aprendizaje de lenguas extranjeras*. Barcelona: Octaedro.
- Valverde, P. (2000). *Máscara, Mato e Morte em São Tomé: textos para una etnografía de São Tomé*. Celta Editora.