

Original Paper

Intertextuality and Shielding of Poetic painting: A Case Study of Qiao Zhongchang's "The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll"

Shengnan Liu^{1*}

¹ College of Liberal Arts, Nanjing University of Information Science & Technology, Nan Jing, China

* Shengnan Liu, College of Liberal Arts, Nanjing University of Information Science & Technology, Nan Jing, China

Received: June 27, 2024

Accepted: July 12, 2024

Online Published: July 26, 2024

doi:10.22158/sll.v8n3p86

URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.22158/sll.v8n3p86>

Abstract

As an art form combining poetry and painting, poetic painting usually presents the emotion and mood of the source poem in a positive and favorable way. However, due to the limitations of painting's ideograms, poetic painting has limitations in presenting the connotations and extensions of poetry. Qiao Zhongchang's The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll of the Northern Song Dynasty is one of the typical models of ancient poetic paintings. From the perspective of the relationship between poetry and painting, the writer analyze the intertextual and shielding phenomena therein, with a view to better understanding the constituent elements of the poetic paintings of the ancient literati and the role they played in the interpenetration of literature and art.

Keywords

poetic intention, The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll, intertextuality between text and image

1. Introduction

With the advent of the "age of reading pictures" and the "visual turn" of literary research, the construction of image-related theories and the relationship between images and language have become increasingly popular topics for academic discussion. In this context, the focus of the academic community is mainly on two aspects: first, the literary field, which focuses on the "text" and emphasizes the pictorialization of the text, focusing on how the "picture" embodies and interprets the "text"; second, the art field, which focuses on the "visualization" of the text; and second, the art field, which focuses on the "visualization" of the text. The second is the field of art, in which the core of

discussion lies in “diagrams”, and more attention is paid to the question of how “text” are made according to “diagrams” and the intertextual relationship between them. The most typical one is the discussion on the relationship between poetry and painting.

The development of poetic-painting intertextuality can be traced back to ancient China, where poets and painters often interacted with each other, influencing each other and jointly promoting the development of Chinese culture and art. In the Song Dynasty, exchanges between poets and painters became more frequent, resulting in artistic phenomena such as “literati painting” and “poetry and painting of the same origin”, which promoted the prosperity and development of culture and art in the Song Dynasty. Ancient Chinese poetic intent mainly consists of two parts, namely, poetic intent painting and source poem, and mostly adopts the creation method of combining poem and picture. Generally speaking, poetic intent is an imitation of poetry, and its effect is characterized by the reproduction of poetic images. Poetic intent is intertextual with the source poem in terms of rhetoric and aesthetic expression. From the perspective of the traditional aesthetic value orientation of “poetry speaks to the will”, poetic intent is mostly modeled on Tang poetry. But the poetic intent began to enter the stage of standardization and prosperity under the influence of Su Shi’s literary concept of “poetry and painting are the same” and Wang Wei’s positive creative influence of “poetry and painting are the same”.

2. The Literary and Paintings Creation of Dongpo’s Red Cliff

In the fifth year of Yuanfeng (1082), Su Shi and his friend Yang Shichang took a boat trip to visit the Red Cliff in Huangzhou. At that time, Su Shi was forty-seven years old, and had been relegated to this place for more than two years because of the “Wutai Poetry Cases”, and with his political ideals of Yao and Shun dashed, and with his endless sorrow and anguish in his heart, Su Shi wrote his famous *Nian Nujiao—Red Cliff and Ancient Memories*, and *Ode to the Red Cliff*. Three months later, Su Shi revisited the Red Cliff and completed his sister work, *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff*. Shortly after the completion of this ode, Mi Fu wrote the *Red Cliff Ode*, which was accompanied by the *Red Cliff Scroll* by Li Gonglin (this work was once in Shen Zhou’s collection, but unfortunately it has long since disappeared). Subsequently, from the Song Dynasty’s Qiao Zhongchang, Ma and Zhi, Song Gaozong, Song Xiaozong, to the Jin and Yuan’s Wu Yuanzhi and Zhao Mengfu, as well as the Ming and Qing’s Wen Zhengming, Dong Qichang, Huang Shen, Ren Yi, etc., were all created with the *Red Cliff Ode* as the title of their paintings, and it is estimated that there are more than 120 surviving Red Cliff Pictures from the Northern Song Dynasty to the Late Qing Dynasty, among which, Wen Zhengming alone has created nearly thirty-six of them. Red Cliff Drawing of the creative group of both emperors and scribes, as well as court painters, foreign artists, different times by ink and brush to send thoughts on the Red Cliff landscape, forming a “one time banished to Huangzhou, the four seas spread for the Red Cliff Drawing” of the wonders of the history of painting.

2.1 The Creation of Dongpo's Chibi with One Poem and Two Odes

The second year of Yuanfeng (1070), Su Shi for Wutai poetry case was deported to Huangzhou, and Bianjing's bustling scene is different, Huangzhou in the Song Dynasty, remote and lonely, Lu You in the *The Book of Entry into Sichuan*, said "(Huang) state is the most secluded less things". This situation of poverty and remoteness to the qing dynasty no obvious change. When Su Shi first arrived in Huangzhou, he was a casual official who did not even have a salary, so he led his family to reclaim a piece of sloping land to the east of the city and planted fields to help make ends meet. He not only managed the crops and fruits, but also built a living room here, personally wrote four big characters Dongpo snow Hall, and called himself Resident of Dongpo. In the four years and two months in Huangzhou, Su Shi not only realized the self-realization of the life of the round, into the self-explanatory life of a new stage, but also reached its creative period of change and harvest period, completed the transformation from Su Shi to Su Dongpo. During this period, 753 literary works came out one after another, there are *Begonia*, *Dingfengbo*, *Raccoon Brook Sand* and other poetic masterpieces, there are *Remembering the Night Journey to Chengtian Temple*, *Touring the Sand Lake*, *Book Linggao Pavilion* and other prose memoirs, but also *Nian Nujiao—Red Cliff and Ancient Memories*, *The Red Cliff Ode*, *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff* literary masterpiece handed down from generation to generation. According to the song history, Su Shi annals, Su Shi anthology and other related historical evidence, Su Shi life ups and downs, there are eight states as governor of the spirit, but also relegated to a remote place of ambition is not rewarded, his change of mind is not overnight, but experienced a period of pain and struggle. Since the Wutai Poetry Case suffered a blow, Su Shi internal pain, deeper self-vigilance, can not do Li Bai "life in the world is not satisfactory, tomorrow morning distribution of the flat boat" of the unrestrained, and can not be as high as Fan Zhongyan general "living in the temple of the high is worried about its people, in the far reaches of the lake is worried about its king!" The national sentiment. Compared with the early period, Su Shi's Huangzhou period of creation shows a reduction in the subject matter, the creative attitude tends to be conservative characteristics, occasionally borrowing the classic micro-irony of the current political situation, less radical political commentary, full of leisure and elegance of the title of the poem is also shelved stagnation, the gift of the poem is also limited to his younger brother, Su Che, and the sporadic friends of his brother. In this regard, Xie Taofang attributed to the change of Su Shi's living environment, that "this living environment (Huangzhou) is very unsuitable for the expression of unrestrained and unrestrained, and the poetic brush is not as flexible as in the early period of time, and so free". From a personal development point of view, after Su Shi's banishment to Huangzhou, the positive Confucianism held in his early years gradually receded, and the Zen ideology of transcendence and open-mindedness became the mainstream, which made Su Shi's relegation poems less rhetorically sharp expression, and more open-mindedness and self-sufficiency of the life of the senses. This is the later scholars for Su Shi's literary works in the spirit of thought, philosophical connotation of the study,

the formation of the general evaluation, but also the creation of the word “Red Cliff” thought of the source.

2.2 The Creation of Dongpo's Red Cliff Scroll

After Su Shi created the word Red Cliff and two odes, since the Northern Song Dynasty to the later generations, there are painters on the subject of Red Cliff for drawing, the literati and ink masters have created a large number of works of art on this theme. Su Shi's *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff* depiction of the scenery, not only to provide the creator with the elements of composition and imagination, but also contains the author's own spiritual and literary ideas, the feelings of the readers of the emotions and resonance of the surge of thought. These qualities contributed to the popularity of the theme of “Dongpo and Red Cliff” in the Southern Song Dynasty, and had a significant impact on the development of poetic painting in later generations. In the Northern Song Dynasty, Li Gonglin's *Red Cliff Scroll* was the earliest Red Cliff scroll, and was rumored to be in the possession of the Ming Dynasty painter Shen Zhou, but it has long since been lost. During the same period, Qiao Zhongchang, Ma Hezhi and Yang Shixian all used Red Cliff as their title. The famous painters Zhao Mengfu and Wu Yuanzhi in the Jin and Yuan dynasties were the most famous among the many Red Cliff Painting which showed the scene of Su Shi's night trip to the Red Cliff in a boat. The Ming Dynasty was the peak period for the creation of “Ode to the Red Cliff” paintings and calligraphy, with the number of authors and works far exceeding that of the previous generation, and there were many fine works, representing painters such as Wen Zhengming and Dong Qichang. Qing Dynasty to “Red Cliff” as the pattern of the most popular artifacts. Since modern times, the book, painting the word Chibi two odes works less, but some big names such as Chen Shao-mei, Zhang Daqian, Fu Baoshi, etc. are happy to paint “Chibi map”, and in the conception, technique, style are beyond the predecessors. Scholar Zhang Kefeng once summarized: “Through the examination of calligraphy and painting of *Red Cliff Ode* through the ages, we see the great influence of literary classics on the creation of calligraphy and painting art. But more importantly, we see the great influence of literary classics in passing down the cultural spirit and shaping the cultural personality, which is the eternal charm of literary classics”. Throughout the history of painting and drawing, the trajectory of the development of the Red Cliff Map can be divided into two stages: Song, Yuan, Jin and the Ming and Qing Dynasties to contemporary. The Song, Yuan, and Jin dynasties laid down the basic pattern of Red Cliff drawings in terms of image translation and poetic acceptance, establishing the tradition of Red Cliff drawings in the history of Chinese literati painting. On this basis, the literati painters of the Ming Dynasty, such as Wen Zhengming and Qiu Ying of the Wu school of painting, vigorously created Red Cliff paintings. In the creation of the painters, on the one hand, vigorously highlight the personal experience, and on the other hand, make Red Cliff drawings on the road of classicization and programatization, and ultimately make the Red Cliff drawings in the Qing Dynasty towards the decline!

In it, Qiao Zhongchang's *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* uses a panoramic compositional approach. The scroll is in the form of a long scroll, employing the painting techniques of "different times, same scene" and "explanatory illustration" to display the poetic journey reflected in Su Shi's prose. It also expresses the painters own understanding and realization of Su Shi's Red Cliff tour, his prose, and the man himself. The painting faithfully translates the literary work, while also blossoming the poetry of the prose, and contains the painter's unique aesthetic experience. In the interaction of text and image, it demonstrates the aesthetic characteristics of intertextuality and mutual interpretation.

3. The Intertextuality between *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* and the Text

"The events of the Red Cliff at Wulin have long passed, but the Red Cliff of Huangzhou is known throughout the world". Su Shi's two visits to the Red Cliff have awakened and repositioned its status in the history of literature and art. the Red Cliff paintings that were inspired by them have also become significant themes in the history of painting. From the perspective of the integration of literature and painting in creation, Qiao Zhongchang's *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* is unique among the existing Red Cliff paintings. The painting faithfully translates the literary work while also blossoming the poetry of the prose, and contains the painter's unique aesthetic experience. By analyzing the painting from the perspective of the relationship between poetry and painting, in terms of its form, content, and historical background, it is found that there is a reference and extension to the context of the poetry, and there is a certain selectivity and subtlety in the expression of the theme. This not only helps to better understand and appreciate the artistic charm of the painting, to delve into the integration and interaction of ancient Chinese literature and art, but also provides new perspectives and ideas for the study of the classic literary phenomenon of "Dongpo's Red Cliff".

3.1 Borrowing in Terms of External Form

As a form of plastic art, painting has a distinct temporary characteristic in narrative and depiction of objects and scenes. Unlike this, literature can freely develop and extend in the dimension of time, possessing distinct flexibility and growth. Therefore, Su Shi's *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff* can orderly and systematically arrange the structure of the article in the order of time. The Ming Dynasty scholar Hu Yinglin once commented: "Apart from a few phrases like 'white dew across the river' in the 'Prequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff', the rest are all discussions without any depiction. The 'Sequel' is more concise than the 'Prequel', yet the real scenes and emotions are not less than ten times that of a painter. If one wants to fill a scroll slowly and abundantly, naturally one cannot forsake the 'Sequel' for the 'Prequel'".

Narrative is not a unique characteristic of text. The French philosopher Jacques Rancière once mentioned: "If poetry and painting can be compared, it is not because painting is a language, or because the colors of painting are similar to the words of poetry; but because both are telling a story, a story that brings about the selection and arrangement of universal and fundamental rules". Under the

same narrative theme, painting tends to imitate poetry in composition and scene selection, a characteristic that is especially evident in poetic paintings and has even become a tradition in the painting of poetic themes for future generations. Qiao's *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* follows the narrative time of the text, dividing the scroll into nine sections for depiction: 1) Human Shadows on the Ground; 2) Carrying Wine and Fish; 3) The River Flows with Sound, the Water Recedes and the Rocks Emerge; 4) Treading on the Precipitous Rocks, Wearing the Overgrown Vegetation; 5) Crouching Like a Tiger or Leopard; 6) Climbing the Coiled Dragon, Grasping the Dangerous Nest; 7) Boarding the Boat and Drifting with the Current, with a Crane Coming from the East; 8) Dreaming of Two Taoist Priests; 9) Astonished and Looking Around. The scroll's ink begins with the first section of the text, "On the full moon of the tenth month of that year", to "Where can I get the wine to drink?" for its scenery, with the composition and the instantaneous capture of the characters' movements all following the spatial order created by the text. A few withered trees imply the autumn scene of "all the leaves have fallen off the trees". At both ends, clusters of wild grass and grotesque rocks serve as an invisible "frame", with a large expanse of blank space in the middle where light ink gently passes, representing the "yellow mud slope" from the text. Then, three elegant gentlemen are depicted, with the one leaning on a staff being the author of the text, Su Shi. Following the yellow mud slope, one sees a young boy and a fisherman catching fish in the reed flowers, which is the instantaneous dynamic capture of the scene 'lifting the net to catch fish.' In addition, behind the four figures of the gentlemen and the young boy, there is light ink rubbing, intended to represent the scene of "human shadows on the ground". Behind them, a large expanse of blank space corresponds to the river water when "lifting the net to catch fish" in the previous section. The overall high degree of match and control of details demonstrate *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* high imitation of the ode of *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff*. The following eight sections follow the same compositional form, each narrating its own story while echoing each other, giving the image, characterized mainly by the coexistence of space, a continuous and complete narrative function.

3.2 Mutual Enhancement in the Textual and Pictorial Representation

Since the Tang and Song dynasties, poetic paintings have often adopted the form of "image" and "text" juxtaposition, which is directly related to the composition and meaning expression of the poetic paintings. Poetic paintings are created based on poetry, and in the broad sense of poetic paintings, there are roughly four types of relationships between poetry and painting: illustrating the poem, revealing the poetic sentiment, the poem inspiring the painting, and the painting having its own poetic essence. Poetic paintings often use the poem as the subject of the painting. As the Northern Song Dynasty painter Guo Xi mentioned in *The Sublime and the Beautiful in Landscape Painting*, seeking "quiet emotions and beautiful interests" that can be painted from poetry is to find the subject of the painting from the artistic conception of the poem. However, poetic paintings are not rigid. Ye Xie once commented on the intertextual rhetorical relationship between poetry and painting, "Painting is form,

and form is profound when it relies on emotion; poetry is emotion, and emotion is evident when it is attached to form". Poetry embellishes the painting in a way that "expresses emotions", giving birth to the feelings contained in the painting, which can clarify the meaning beyond the image and the sound beyond the painting, thereby enhancing the value of the scroll; while the painting promotes the poem in a way that "shows the scenery", facilitating the spread of poetry from top to bottom. Poetry and painting are associated with each other through the similarity of context and serve as metaphors for each other, complementing each other in the way their respective symbols are good at. The artistic conception that the painting cannot express is conveyed through the language of the poem, and the objects that the poem cannot present are presented by the painting. Poetry and painting together create a rich and profound artistic conception, presenting a unique aesthetic effect.

The compositional form of *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll*, which features the juxtaposition of text and image, was first seen in the Han Dynasty and fully developed during the Six Dynasties period. Existing works such as *Admonitions Scroll*, *Biographies of Exemplary Women*, and *The Goddess of the Luo River Scroll* all employ this compositional form. *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* is divided into nine sections, each depicting a scene and transcribing the text of each section in small regular script, skillfully displaying the entire text of *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff* within the painting. The scene selection corresponds with the narrative of the rhapsody, maintaining a high degree of consistency. The entire painting is imbued with a strong narrative quality. From the perspective of expressive effect, the rhapsody serves to separate and fill in the gaps, complementing the blank spaces of the painting; in terms of purpose, the presence of the rhapsody enhances the narrative quality of the image, making up for the insufficiency in the expression of the image. This combination of rhapsody and painting not only divides the image but also stimulates the viewer's reading initiative. As the scroll unfolds and the viewer moves through the scenes, the entire rhapsody gradually becomes complete through the viewer's active observation. When the viewing activity ends, a complete narrative is thus formed. The frame composed of the rhapsody and the mountains, rocks, and trees constantly reminds the viewer of the existence of the overall image, thereby maximizing the narrative effect of the image.

As stated above, by further comparing the content of the rhapsody in *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff* with the visual content of *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* from the perspective of the intertextual relationship between poetry and painting, the intertextuality between poetry and painting embodied in the scroll becomes even more evident, typically manifested as the intertextuality of the interplay between the virtual and the real. "Virtual and real" is an important category of ancient Chinese aesthetics and artistic characteristics. Specifically, in *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* the intertextuality of "giving birth to each other through the virtual and the real" is mainly manifested in two aspects: first, in places where characters should appear, there are no characters, but the characters are hidden, such as in the scene "Crouching Like a Tiger or Leopard". In this scene, Su

Shi does not appear but is virtualized. Only the words “Crouching Like a Tiger or Leopard” and the hard and strange brushwork suggest the steepness of the climb and the grandeur of the mountain. Although Su Shi himself does not appear in the scroll, he has already fallen into the artistic conception of the painting. This is because the painter used the first-person perspective in the context of the rhapsody. Due to the anchoring effect of the text, the change in the visual perspective is not abrupt, but it adds to the viewer’s interest; second, in the same scene, reality and illusion are presented at the same time, such as in the segment “Dreaming of Two Taoist Priests”. In this image, Su Shi’s sleeping state is visible to the viewer’s eyes, but Su Shi’s dream is, by common sense, invisible to the viewer. However, in *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll*, the “real Su Shi” and the “Su Shi” and “Two Taoist Priests” in the dream appear at the same time. This is an overflow of the image from the source poem, allowing the viewer to intuitively take in the dream and reality at the same time, both true and illusory.

3.3 Mutual Enhancement of Inner Meaning and Artistic Conception

Poetic paintings from the Tang Dynasty were primarily manifested in the form of literati painting. Literati painting is a form of painting that emphasizes poetry and artistic conception, focusing on the expression of the painter’s personality and emotions, and highlighting the beauty of natural landscapes and the aesthetics of life forms. Poetic paintings from the Song Dynasty were mainly characterized by landscape and flower-and-bird paintings, with works emphasizing the depiction of the grandeur of nature’s mountains and waters, the charm and vitality of natural landscapes.

Life experiences and cultural backgrounds can influence an artist’s painting style, while personal temperament and preferences play a decisive role on a subjective level. In the Southern Song Dynasty, Deng Chun’s *Hua Ji, Volume Four, Jin Shen Wei Bu* records: “Qiao Zhongchang, a native of Hezhong, was skilled in various types of paintings and studied under Long Mian. Longing to return home while besieged in the city, one day he created the *Hezhong Chart* as a gift to Shao Zemin, the imperial censor, which is still kept in his family to this day. He also has works such as *Mountain Dwelling Arhats*, *Yuanming Listening to the Pine Wind*, *Li Bai Catching the Moon*, *Xuan Zhenzi at the West Dam*, *Liezi Riding the Wind*, and *Dragon Palace Scattered Fast* hand scrolls, which are passed down through the ages”. According to *Hua Ji*, which records the life of Qiao Zhongchang, he had neither an official position nor a prominent family background, being a low-status scholar at the bottom of society. However, due to the influence of his paintings, he had good personal relationships with some high-ranking officials (such as the imperial censor Shao Zemin) or high-level literati of the time. Among them, Su Shi’s ‘literati painting’ ideology had a particularly evident influence on Qiao Zhongchang’s *Sequel to the Ode to the Red Scroll*, mainly reflected in the charm of brush and ink and the aesthetic style. Su Shi believed that the purpose of painting was for self-satisfaction and to express feelings, so the charm of his brush and ink appeared to be freely dotted and written, not seeking similarity in form, pursuing the image of “desolate and simple distance” and “ancient elegance and light tranquility”. The Shanghai Museum has a painting by Su Shi called “Ancient Wood and Strange

Stones”, in which the dead tree branches are twisted without end, the brushwork is hard, and the ink is applied with a rugged texture, presenting a light, ethereal, and loose style throughout the painting. When translating *Sequel to the Ode to the Red Painting* into painting, Qiao Zhongchang conveyed Su Shi’s open-minded thoughts and emotions by depicting a desolate and simple distant artistic conception. The natural and relaxed line shapes and the naive and plain artistic interest in the *Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* are in line with the purpose and interest of Su Shi’s “literati painting” ideology.

In the history of Chinese painting, there are many paintings on the theme of “Dongpo’s Red Cliff”, not limited to Qiao Zhongchang’s *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll*. Long before Qiao, Li Gonglin had painted *The Red Cliff* (now lost). Subsequently, artists such as Ma Hezhi and Li Song from the Southern Song Dynasty, Wu Yuanzhi from the Jin Dynasty, Zhao Mengfu and Wu Zhen from the Yuan Dynasty, Tang Yin and Qiu Ying from the Ming Dynasty, Wen Jia and Gu Xiu, Qian Hui’an from the Qing Dynasty, and modern Fu Baoshi have all created works of the ‘Dongpo’s Red Cliff’ category. The “Dongpo’s Red Cliff” depicted by painters through the ages is not a mere repetition and re-presentation of the original poem; the scrolls are intertextual with each other, creating a rich tapestry of imagery. Moreover, the reason why “Dongpo’s Red Cliff” has become a subject of great interest to painters of later generations lies in the rich philosophical thoughts contained in Su Shi’s *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff*. The core of this philosophy is the discussions between Su Shi and his guest, Su Shi and the crane, and Su Shi and the Red Cliff in the two odes and one lyric poem. Su Shi explored the relationship between humans and the vast nature, the infinite time, and his own existence in these three dialogues. This text, imbued with profound philosophical contemplation, represents the introspective spirit valued by literati of the Song Dynasty and became the direct reason for the popularity of “Red Cliff” images in the Southern Song period and the establishment of painting paradigms in the early Southern Song Dynasty.

4. The Occlusion of The Rhapsody in *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll*

The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Painting by Qiao Zhongchang of the Northern Song Dynasty has attracted considerable attention in academia. However, Qiao’s painting does not encompass all the characteristics of the Red Cliff imagery. What the painting unfolds is merely the “poetic eye” rather than the entirety of the poetic sentiment; its imitation is but an “example” rather than a complete representation of the poetry. The poetic painting is like a screen standing in the context of poetry, with intertextuality that is sometimes hidden and sometimes revealed, adding tension between the poem and the image. Yet, the opacity of the image, while allowing the poetic sentiment to bloom, also shields the world behind the image. Compared to text, the image has its inherent “flaws” and “insufficiencies” in expressing poetic sentiment. Therefore, to truly understand the profound implications behind it, there must be a connectable cultural background and “context” between the poet and the painter, and between the painter and the viewer. This “connection” is not something everyone can understand and

grasp, as it may “dissipate” or “dissolve” due to differences in era and environment. Apart from subjective factors that vary from person to person, language and image, when exerting their symbolic characteristics, will inevitably cause a phenomenon of mutual occlusion due to their different forms of narrative expression.

4.1 *The Visual Semiotics Constraints in The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll*

In ancient China, poetry, calligraphy, and painting often influenced and permeated each other, forming a unique cultural phenomenon. Among them, the interaction between painting and poetry was particularly notable. Among the many types of poetry and painting interaction, poetic painting is a more typical category. It can not only convey profound emotions and thoughts to the viewer through the image but also embed the artistic conception of poetry to achieve communication and exchange across time and space, bringing about a unique artistic style and aesthetic experience. Huang Tingjian once inscribed a poem for Li Gonglin’s *Yangguan Chart* saying: “Marquis Li has verses but will not speak, using light ink to compose a silent poem”. For poets, the more valuable aspect is conception, while the less valuable aspect is expression; for painters, the situation is just the opposite. The dots, lines, and combinations of brush strokes in painting are not only the basic elements that constitute artistic images but also important and have independent aesthetic value as objects of appreciation. The speed, lightness and heaviness of the brush strokes, and the density, thickness, and delicacy of the dots and lines create a unique rhythm and rhythmicity that should reflect the painter’s unique mindset, temperament, and personality during the creative process. These should be organically combined with the form and spirit of the subject matter, achieving a correspondence between heart and hand, and harmony between energy and expression—where the trace may be broken but the spirit is continuous, and the brush does not fully cover but the meaning is complete. From this perspective, poets are not good at depicting the beauty of lifeless objects; they always cleverly use artistic techniques such as metaphor and empathy to endow all things with life and emotion. The skill of poetic language lies in making the images the poet wants to evoke in our hearts seem as if they are alive, creating a vivid illusion, while the essence of poetry is to forget the language itself through the images produced by the language. Paintings that unfold in space are better at depicting objects, while poetic language that accumulates in time is more suitable for expressing motion. The former implies motion through the most pregnant moment of the object, allowing a clear understanding from this moment before and after. The latter implies the object through the continuity of motion in time, using the most vivid and sensory-rich attribute of the object.

This makes the image, as a visual symbol in the process of conveying emotions and ideas, only capable of representing the tangible existence of things as seen. For example, Su Shi describes the feeling of ascending the Red Cliff in his rhapsody: “I also feel a quiet sadness, a solemn fear”, where “sadness” and “fear” are psychological feelings, not something that can be observed visually. In addition, Qiao Zhongchang in *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* can depict the scene of “all the leaves

fallen, human shadows on the ground”, but cannot portray the scene of “looking back and taking pleasure, responding to each other with songs”. Even if it is possible to imply the existence of the action of “responding” through the movements of the people in the painting, the “singing while walking” action before it is overlooked. This is the limitation of the image in recreating the poetic level of “not quite achieving” in the painting, and it is also the limitation of the poetic painting as a rhetorical image of poetry.

Even if the painter intentionally selects tangible objects for the composition, not all forms can be visually reproduced. This involves the issue of whether the image reproduction can not only “achieve the painting” but also “resemble the subject”. For instance, the phrases “The river flows with sound, the broken bank stands a thousand feet high; the mountain is high and the moon is small, the water recedes and the rocks emerge”. Qiao could certainly lay out the banks, mountains, moon, water, and rocks from these descriptions side by side on the canvas, within the same plane. However, the transcendent and lofty implications that the context of the rhapsody aims to express have already been separated, making the image’s reproduction of the poetry even less “lifelike”. It’s no wonder that Emperor Qianlong of the Qing Dynasty regarded *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* as an ordinary landscape painting. If the text of the rhapsody and Zhao Deyin’s colophon were removed from the painting, it would be difficult for us to distinguish it from other landscape paintings.

4.2 *The Alienation among the Author, the Painter, and the Viewer*

Paying tribute to and rhetoricizing the source poetry is an innate characteristic of images. As literary works with typical class attributes, the spread of poetic and prose odes is very limited among the lower laboring masses and the petty urban citizen class. Therefore, the process of transforming poetry into poetic painting, making it visually accessible, is also the process by which the original poetry is widely accepted and disseminated. Some people may be illiterate, but almost everyone can understand paintings, hence the ancient practice of storytelling literature, which often used to set up paintings in front of shops to promote and attract customers, known as “setting up stalls to narrate and sing”. It can be seen that the presence of visual temptation is more attractive than the connotation of textual content. However, painters of all dynasties were not satisfied with simply recreating the artistic conception of the text in *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff*. They also tried to reconstruct the poetic scenes of the text on the basis of interpreting it, in order to convey their own aesthetic ideals and emotional expression. In painting, painters generally adopt the third-person narrative mode, change the narrative perspective, adjust the narrative rhythm according to the compositional needs, and transform the narrative tension of “The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff” into the ornamentality of the Chibi landscape; secondly, painters intentionally reshape the image of Su Shi, transforming Su Shi’s philosophical contemplation and the desolation of his demotion in the text into a leisurely and open-minded attitude towards life; furthermore, painters project their personal aesthetic interests onto the canvas, expressing their subjective contemplation of nature and landscapes while reproducing “The

Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff” with painting, thereby re-examining the multiple philosophical propositions of “Dongpo Red Cliff”, enhancing the understanding and interpretation of Su Shi himself and his literature, and allowing the image to escape from the text and have its own realm.

The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll is a secondary creation of Chibi literature, a manifestation by the painter after immersing themselves in the literary world based on the dissemination of Chibi poetry and prose. The emergence of the Chibi painting is inevitably an acceptance of Chibi literature by the world, and on this basis, feedback is given through the brush. This is a soul and thought exchange that transcends time, beyond the specific historical figure of Dongpo, condensing into an image symbol with unique meaning and thought value, expressing the same spiritual pursuit and romantic sentiment of ancient Chinese literati in different times, different eras, and different social backgrounds. Unlike the expressive effect of text, the display of the image does not match the personal experience structure of the viewer but directly expresses the “Chibi spirit” in the painter’s mind. Viewers need to find their own direction through the dual gaps of textual and pictorial languages, thus transcending the charm of the spirit of Dongpo by predecessors, and forming a Chibi spirit that belongs to a specific era, a specific group of people, or even a person.

Furthermore, the imagery in *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff* does not arise from a single piece but must be re-examined within Su Shi’s collection of one poem and two odes. *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll* also did not achieve fame in the history of painting for being a single work. The extensive creation of Red Cliff paintings was partly due to the emperors’ leadership; Su Shi’s poetry and prose were highly esteemed in the early Southern Song Dynasty, especially during the reigns of Emperor Gaozong and Emperor Xiaozong, from the emperor himself to officials, nobles, scholars, and down to ordinary literati. On the other hand, “Dongpo’s Red Cliff” has become a classic subject in the history of literature and painting, deeply related to the scholar-official complex, even extending to Wang Anshi’s *Xie Gongdun* becoming a laughingstock. This requires painters, when depicting the Red Cliff, and viewers, when appreciating the painting, not only to be able to associate the profound spirit of the Red Cliff through the images displayed on the scroll but also to go back to the Northern Song period, to capture the background and cultural atmosphere of the creation of the Red Cliff text and painting, and to perceive its transcendence.

5. Conclusion

The intertextuality of poetic paintings offers a rich ground for artistic exploration and intellectual engagement, allowing for a multi-layered appreciation of cultural and emotional depth. However, this study has also highlighted the phenomenon of occlusion, where the visual elements of a painting may overshadow or obscure aspects of the poetic text, leading to a partial understanding or even misinterpretation of the intended message. The limitations inherent in both textual and visual expressions call for a recognition of the unique strengths and weaknesses of each medium in conveying

poetic sentiment. The significance of cultural context and personal subjectivity in the appreciation of poetic paintings cannot be overstated. As times evolve and environments change, so too does the perception of these artworks, with the potential for original meanings to be lost or transformed. It is through a shared cultural understanding and a deep engagement with the context that the full spectrum of poetic imagery can be truly unlocked. Despite the challenges posed by occlusion, the union of poetry and painting remains a vital conduit for exploring the human condition, a testament to the enduring power of art to communicate complex ideas and emotions across time and space.

References

- Chu, J. D., & Li, Z. Y. (2018). The Reception of Poetic Imagery and the Establishment of Tradition: An Exploration of Qiao Zhongchang's *The Sequel to the Ode to the Red Cliff Scroll*. *Journal of Yangtze University* November, 41(3), 68-70.
- Gao, J. H. (2014). *Illustrated History of Chinese Painting* (Li Yu, Trans.). Beijing: Sanlian Bookstore.
- Gotthold, E. L. (1984). *Laocoon: An Essay on the Limits of Painting and Poetry* (Zhu Guangqian, Trans.). Beijing: People's Literature Publishing House.
- Mitchell, W. J. T. (2020). *Iconology: Image, Text, Ideology* (Chen Yongguo, Trans.). Beijing: Peking University Press.
- Shi, S. Q. (2019). *Echoes in the Mountains and Valleys*. Shanghai: Shanghai Calligraphy and Painting Publishing House.
- Walter, B. (2001). *Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction*. Beijing: China City Publishing House.
- Wang, J. H. (2022). The Relationship and Meaning Expression of Text and Image in Ancient Chinese Farming and Weaving Paintings. *Ethnic Art*, (04), 141-152.
- Wu, H. (2012). *Tales of Ruins: "Presence" and Absence in Chinese Art and Visual Culture*. Shanghai: Shanghai People's Publishing House.
- Xie, T. F. (1985). *Research on Su Shi's Poetry*. Chengdu: Basu Publishing House.
- Ye, L. (1985). *An Outline History of Chinese Aesthetics*. Shanghai: Shanghai People's Publishing House.
- Zhao, X. Z. (2022). *Theories of Literary and Visual Representation*. Beijing: The Commercial Press.
- Zong, B. H. (1981). *Aesthetic Strolls*. Shanghai: Shanghai People's Publishing House.
- Zu, X. Y. (2021). The cause of "Red Cliff Paintings" becoming a paradigm in the early Southern Song Dynasty painting. *Art Research*, (03), 40-42.